Aleksandra Rabrenovic

Human Resources Management in the Civil Service

1. HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN THE CIVIL SERVICE AND INTEGRITY CHALLENGES IN THE WESTERN BALKANS

The human resource management system considerably affects the way in which civil service operates. Abuses in the human resource management system are an important source of corruption and may undermine civil servants' motivation, impartiality and professionalism, jeopardising efficiency of the entire civil service.

Corruption can have a negative effect on all aspects of human resource management (HRM). Nepotism and abuse of authority can be present both during the recruitment and selection process, and in the course of performance appraisal, promotion, rewarding and training. Even though the causes of corruption in HRM are numerous, in principle, it is enabled by excessive discretionary powers and the lack of integrity among key actors within the HRM system.

In order for one institution to become "resistant to corruption" in this field, it is important to ensure the observance of the merit principle, that is, of professional competence as the key measure at all stages of human resource management. In a wider sense, the merit system can be defined as the establishment of a particular civil service value system that is based on professionalism, competence and integrity, the objective of which is to serve the public interest. The respect of the merit principle assumes that all HRM processes, including the recruitment, appraisal, promotion, career development, rewarding, training and termination of employment, will be based on the professional capacities and competences of civil servants.

If human resource management is carried out in line with the merit principle and in line with ethical values,[1] civil servants will be motivated to work and

---

1   Ethical values in the civil service are standards of behaviour expected of all civil servants, which include integrity, honesty, objectivity and impartiality. See, for example: *the*

do their best. An institution that has a developed HRM system will attract and employ quality staff, with adequate competences and the potential for advancement. To remain qualified such personnel would continuously advance their knowledge, skills and abilities. The system would motivate and keep quality staff through fair promotions and a merit-based reward system. As a result, the employees would work professionally, responsibly and conscientiously, thereby strengthening the reputation of the civil service. In short, a sound public HRM system would promote actions taken in accordance with the professionalism and accountability principles, in line with the purpose for which the public institution in question has been established.

Overall, human resource management practices in the civil service in the Western Balkans countries are still not sufficiently based on merit. Even with a sound regulatory framework on paper, human resource management rules are not effectivelly implemented and internalised. This has negative effects on civil servants' motivation and the effectiveness of the entire civil service.

Despite well-conceived recruitment and selection procedures, new personnel in the civil service is often not sufficiently qualified and is hired on the grounds of political, family or other types of "connections". Even in cases when mandatory written exams are prescribed, which should ideally guarantee impartiality in decision-making, the exam questions might have been leaked to a certain candidate in advance.[2] When interviews are conducted, it is even easier to ensure that candidates who have political or other kinds of support are rated better than those who do not enjoy such support. It is not unusual that some candidates first enter into employment under temporary arrangements (without a competitive procedure), which gives them a comparative advantage during the subsequent competition procedure, due to familiarity with the job and inside connections.[3]

In times of transition and economic crises, when the options for employment in the private sector may be limited, the pressures to obtain employment in the civil service may be particularly strong. In such conditions, the impact of the mechanisms that do not promote employment based on professional competences alone will be even more detrimental.

Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010 (C 25), Chapter 25, The Stationary Office Limited UK, 2010, available at: http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/25/contents.

2   J. M. Sahling *et al*, "Improving the Implementation of Merit Recruitment Procedures in the Western Balkans: Analysis and Recommendations", paper presented at the ReSPA annual conference in Danolovgrad, November 2015, p. 30.

3   A. Rabrenovic, "Izazovi procesa zapošljavanja u državnoj službi u BiH – pravni i sociološki aspekt" [Recruitment and Selection Challenges in the BiH Civil Service – Legal and Sociological Aspect], *Strani pravni zivot [Foreign Legal Life]*, No. 2/2015, pp. 117–130.

A major problem in most Western Balkans countries is the widespread politicisation of senior managerial positions in the civil service.[4] After a change of government following elections, persons holding senior managerial positions are often replaced by "trusted people" of the new political elite, despite a well-established regulatory framework.[5] Such politicisation has adverse effects on continuity, quality of work, and to a large extent the stability of the civil service.

Another problem is the hierarchical structure of the civil service itself, which tends to restrict civil servants' career development. Most civil service systems in the Western Balkan countries are position-based systems, where career development is possible only if there is a higher vacant position. Promotion to higher positions, however, often depends on factors such as personal or political connections.

All the above problems demonstrate a need for integrity strengthening in the civil service HRM systems in the Western Balkan countries. Special attention needs to be paid to the process of recruitment and selection, as well as performance appraisal and promotion, as these are the key elements of the ethical framework of any HRM system. Therefore, this chapter shall consider in greater detail the international standards, regulatory framework and practices in these three fields.

2. WHAT ARE THE KEY INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS IN THE AREA OF HRM?

2.1. EU – OECD/SIGMA PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION PRINCIPLES ON HRM

The fundamental internationally accepted standard in human resources management in the civil service is the merit principle. As mentioned earlier, the merit principle can be defined in a broad sense as the establishment of a separate civil service value system that is based on professionalism, competence and integrity, aimed at achieving public interest objectives.[6]

---

4   Senior managerial positions in the civil service in most Western Balkan countries include the following posts: secretary-general of a ministry, head of department in a ministry and director general of an administrative body (administration, agency, institute etc).

5   SIGMA, *Monitoring Report: the Principles of Public Administration, Serbia*, OECD Publishing, Paris, 2017, p. 75.

6   P. W. Ingraham, "Building Bridges over Troubled Waters: Merit as a Guide", *Public Administration Review*, 2006, pp. 486–495.

The merit system presents a counterbalance to the political loyalty system, known informally as the "spoils system", in which civil service positions are obtained more or less exclusively based on political affiliations, rather than on professional merit.[7] All additional standards applied in HRM are indisputably founded on the merit principle.

Due to national differences, the area of human resources management is usually not a subject of international conventions or a part of the EU *acquis communautaire*. However, over the past decades, several important international legal acts have been adopted providing an international legal basis for regulation in this field. Furthermore, this area is also governed by the so-called *"soft acquis"*, which constitutes common standards as agreed by the EU Member States, and which influences indirectly the development of the national law.[8] Although they are not legally binding, these standards can have a significant practical impact on the countries seeking EU membership, as the European Commission uses them as benchmarks for assessing progress towards membership.

In order to develop the European HRM requirements further, the European Commission's and OECD SIGMA programme[9] has developed a document named "The Principles of Public Administration",[10] in which a prominent place has been given to the field human resources management in the civil/ public service. The basic standards are defined in a quite detailed manner, in line with European legislation, and they also involve good European practices in the field of HRM and other public administration fields. The key human resources management principles in the public service developed by OECD/SIGMA are presented in the table below.

---

7   The establishment of the "spoils system", which is present in many countries even to this date, is interesting because it was actually considered to be the best public administration organisation system in a democratic society. President of United States Jackson thus pointed that: "In a country where offices are created solely for the benefit of the people no one man has any more intrinsic right to official station than another". However, the functioning of the "spoils system" caused a massive expansion of corruption and abuse in the United States federal administration system and rapid abandoning of this system. See: E. Pusić, *Nauka o upravi* [Administrative Science], 1973, pp. 178–179.

8   M. Keune, "EU Enlargement and Social Standards – Exporting the European Social Model?", *The European Union and the Social Dimension of Globalisation, How the EU Influences the World* (J. Orbie, L. Tortell), Routhledge, 2009, p. 52.

9   Having recognised the importance of a well-regulated and organised public administration for the fulfilment of the membership requirements in all sectoral areas, in 1992, EU cooperated with the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) to establish the SIGMA programme (SIGMA – *Support for Improvement in Governance and Management*). The Programme aims at providing support to public administration reform activities in (potential) candidate states. The programme is mainly funded by the EU and represents one of the main instruments of the European Commission in promoting capacity development in public administration in Central and Eastern Europe, as well as a technical assistance service to the candidate states.

10   SIGMA, *Principles of Public Administration*, OECD publishing, Paris, 2014.

Table 1: OECD/SIGMA Public Administration Principles related to Public Service and Human Resources Management

Principle 1:	The scope of public service is adequate, clearly defined and applied in practice.
Principle 2:	The policy and legal framework for a professional and coherent public service are established and applied in practice; the institutional set-up enables consistent and effective human resource management practices across the public service.
Principle 3:	The recruitment of public servants is based on merit and equal treatment in all its phases; the criteria for demotion and termination of public servants are explicit.
Principle 4:	Direct or indirect political influence on senior managerial positions in the public service isprevented.
Principle 5:	The public servants remuneration system is based on the job classification; it is fair and transparent
Principle 6:	The professional development of public servants is ensured; this includes regular training, fair performance appraisal and mobility, and promotion based on objective and transparent criteria and merit.
Principle 7:	Measures for promoting integrity and preventing corruption and ensuring discipline in the public service are in place.

Since the beginning of the EU accession process involving Central and South-East Europe countries, OECD/SIGMA has been regularly assessing the human resources management situation in (potential) candidate countries; the same was done in new EU Member States both before and after their full-fledged membership.[11] Such extensive experience enables OECD/SIGMA not only to develop further but also to update its standards and recommendations in the field of human resources management, and thus improve their assessment of the countries that are currently preparing for the EU membership.[12]

Due to their importance for achieving integrity in the civil service, this chapter will elaborate in further detail the following underlying OECD/SIGMA principles: Principle 3, relative to recruitment and termination of employment of public servants; Principle 4, covering senior managerial positions; and Principle 6, which concerns performance appraisal, promotion and mobility of public servants. It should be noted that principle 6 also includes training of civil servants. However, due to the limited scope of this analysis, it falls outside of the span of this publication.

---

11   J. Meyer-Sahling, "Sustainability of Civil Service Reforms in Central and Eastern Europe Five Years After EU Accession", Sigma Papers, No. 44, 2009, OECD Publishing, Paris, 2009, available at: *10.1787/5kml60pvjmbq-en* [15 September 2016]*.*

12   SIGMA working paper, "Can Civil Service Reforms Last? The European Union's 5th Enlargement and Future Policy Orientations", http://www.rcpar.org/mediaupload/publications/2010/20100311_SIGMA_can_reforms_last.pdf, 4 December, 2012.

2.1.1. Recruitment and selection and termination of employment

Recruitment by way of competition is the fundamental pre-condition of a merit-based civil service system. How a public competition is managed is particularly important, as it should provide all citizens with the right to work in the public administration on equal terms. That right, in fact, is also constitutionally granted in many European countries. In addition, public competitions provide the possibility of finding the best-suited job seekers in the labour market.

According to good European practice, particularly promoted by OECD/SIGMA, competition procedures need to be carried out by recruitment and selection committees, operating independently from political influence. Members of these committees should possess a solid understanding of the tasks to be performed in the advertised position, along with the skills and competence required. They also need to be trained on selection procedures to be able to implement them in a consistent and fair fashion. The committees should be broadly composed and comprise representatives of various ethnicities, genders, etc.

The selection criteria should include knowledge, skills and personal characteristics (competences) required for performing the tasks of any advertised vacancy. Apart from the knowledge of the field relevant for the job, and the ability to acquire new knowledge, it is very important to include in the selection criteria the skills and abilities of the candidate that are necessary for efficiently carrying out of the work in practice.

Good practice in the EU member states demonstrates the advantages of conducing structured interviews during the later stages of the selection process.[13] Structured interviews include determining beforehand questions that all applicants will be asked, making detailed notes during interviews and a pre-determined system for evaluating answers received from applicants. In practice, structured interviews have proven to be an exceptionally valid job performance indicator for newly employed personnel, and the information obtained through structured interviews has proven to be more accurate and reliable than that obtained through unstructured interviews. As noted in practice — the skills needed to develop and ask relevant questions are not a natural gift, and therefore it is necessary that committee members (whether they are civil servants or external) attend training courses to learn how to ask proper questions that will enable them to test the knowledge, skills and

---

13   See: Department of Finance and Personnel, *Recruitment Policy and Procedures Manual, Northern Ireland Civil Service*, 2010.

personal suitability of applicants, and how to evaluate the answers they receive during interviews.

In order to ensure the rights of all competing applicants, they should have the right to appeal the final competition results to a second-instance administration body (normally, an appeals commission), and to bring their case to a competent court in case they consider that they have been treated unfairly or illegally (for example, an administrative court). Furthermore, the criteria for demotion and termination of employment of a public servant should be explicitly stated by law. As in the case of appointment, civil servants should have the right of appeal decisions on their demotion and employment termination.

More specific recruitment standards included in OECD/SIGMA's Principles of Public Administration are provided in the table below.

Table 2: OECD/SIGMA Principles of Public Administration
– Recruitment and dismissal standards

Principle 3: The recruitment of public servants is based on merit and equal treatment in all its phases; the criteria for demotion and termination of public servants are explicit.

1. The recruitment and selection process in the public service, either external or internal and regardless of the category/class of public servant, is clearly based on merit, equal opportunity and open competition. The public service law shall clearly establish that any form of recruitment and selection not based on merit is considered legally invalid.

2. The general eligibility criteria for applying for public service positions and general provisions ensuring the quality of the recruitment are established in the primary legislation. The detailed procedures, including specific requirements for entering each category/class, job descriptions, competency profiles, selection methods, scoring systems and composition of selection committees, are covered mainly by secondary legislation.

3. The recruitment and selection committees include persons with expertise and experience in assessing different sets of skills and competences of candidates for public service positions, with no political interference.

4. Candidates who are not appointed have the right to appeal unfair recruitment decisions.

5. Protection against discrimination of persons applying to and those employed in the public service is ensured by all administrative bodies, in accordance with the principle of equal treatment. In the cases explicitly established in the law, comprehensive equitable representation is taken into account in the recruitment process.

6. The objective criteria for demotion of public servants and termination of the public service relationship are explicitly established in the law. These provisions are applied in practice.

7. Public servants have the right to appeal against unfair demotion and dismissal.

2.1.2. Senior managerial positions

Although depoliticisation of senior managerial positions has long been one of the main principles in HRM in the civil service, the experiences of new EU Member States and the Western Balkan countries show that this ideal is very difficult to achieve in practice. It should not be forgotten that elements of politicisation are present also in many old EU Member States. Comparative experience demonstrates that achieving success in this crucial area of civil service reform requires much more than adopting new legislation. Establishment of trust and cooperation between political parties and interest groups is necessary to develop a common interest in establishing a professional administration without politicisation.

That is why OECD/SIGMA proposes that the The focus should be put on prescribing specific, transparent requirements (educational requirements, relevant work experience and competences) for applicants for the senior managerial positions. Competition is a mandatory standard in the selection process as it enables the testing of candidates' knowledge, skills and aptitudes (competences). Finally, termination of employment of senior managerial positions should be allowed only in explicitly defined cases (for example, appointment for a certain number of years clearly defined at the outset) or under a procedure determined in the law.

Table 3: OECD/SIGMA Principles of Public Administration –
senior managerial positions (principle 4)

Principle 4: Direct or indirect political influence on senior managerial positions in the public service is prevented

1. The category/class/level of senior managerial positions in the public service, at the interface of politics and administration, is included in the scope of public service (usually the positions of the secretary-general of the ministry and director-general of the administrative body determine the upper dividing line between public servants and political appointees).

2. The criteria for recruiting persons to the senior managerial positions are clearly established and disclosed.

3. The recruitment and selection process to the senior managerial positions, either external or internal, is based on merit, equal opportunities and open competition.

4. The termination of employment of public servants holding senior managerial positions is only admissible in cases explicitly provided for, and under the procedural provisions established in the law.

2.1.3. Performance appraisal, promotion and mobility of civil servants

Performance appraisal of civil servants is an integral part of a modern HRM system, aimed at of systematic monitoring their work and their professional development. For an appraisal to be purposeful, it needs to be conducted periodically and regularly (normally once a year). To ensure a systematic and unified approach, the basic appraisal principles should be established by law, while secondary legislation may be used to elaborate them in greater detail. Contemporary appraisal models are frequently based on an evaluation of the achievement of the key work objectives, along with the evaluation of other previously determined work criteria.[14]

For the purpose of setting up of a professional civil service, it is extremely important to provide incentives to employees by establishing objective promotion criteria and encouraging horizontal mobility. The conditions for promotion of civil servants (horizontal and vertical), should be defined by law, based on merit and objective and transparent criteria. In addition, mobility of civil servants should also be encouraged (secondment, temporary and mandatory transfer) and based on objective and transparent criteria. The table below presents SIGMA Principle 6, which further elaborates these areas.

Table 4: OECD/SIGMA Principles of Public Aministration – Performance appraisal, promotion and mobility of public servants (Principle 6)[15]

Principle 6: The professional development of public servants is ensured: this includes regular training, fair performance appraisal, and mobility and promotion based on objective and transparent criteria and merit.

The principles of performance appraisal are established in law to ensure the coherence of the whole public service. The detailed provisions are established in secondary legislation. The performance appraisal of public servants is carried out regularly. The public servants have the right to appeal unfair performance appraisal decisions.

The mobility of public servants (secondment, temporary or mandatory transfer) is encouraged, established in legislation, based on objective and transparent criteria, and applied in practice.

The functional promotion of public servants (on-the-job, horizontal and vertical promotion) is established in the legislation, based on the merit principle and objective and transparent criteria, and applied in practice.

---

14 A. Rabrenovic, M. Matijević, "Comparagraphtive analysis of basic elements of civil servants appraisal systems in European countries" in: *Topical issues of modern legislation – Compendium of papers presented at the meeting of law practicioners held on 12–16 June 2011 in Budva, Budva Days of Law Practicioners*, Federation of Associations of Lawyers of Serbia and Republic of Srpska, Belgrade, 2011, pp. 515–528**.**

15 Professional development is also included in the principle 6 of SIGMA Principles of Public Administration, but is not presented here as it exceeds the scope of this analysis.

3. WHAT IS THE GENERAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK IN THE AREA OF HRM IN THE COUNTRIES OF THE WESTERN BALKANS?

This section provides a brief overview of the legal framework in the area of HRM in the civil service in six countries in the Western Balkans. The primary legislation that regulates the civil servant status is presented first. The subsequent analysis of individual countries comprises the following elements:

- Initiating recruitment process
- Recruitment commissions
- Selection process
- Appointments
- Senior managerial positions
- Performance appraisal
- Promotion
- Termination of employment

3.1. ALBANIA

Primary legislation: Law on Civil Servants.[16]

Initiating recruitment process: The existing legislative framework prescribes the requirements for the development of a career system, with priority given to a competitive selection for lower-ranking civil service positions and ensuring conditions for career advancement. For this reason, before a public competition is announced, public authorities must make an attempt to transfer the existing civil servants to any given vacant position. Such transfers are done by selecting candidates who are in the same category as the vacant position; this task is entrusted to permanent internal commissions that are obliged to adhere to the principles of equal opportunities and merit.[17] Once this procedure is completed, the commissions appoint the most successful candidate, or end the procedure without an appointment, if none of the candidates meets

---

16   Law on Civil Servants, Nos. 152/2013 and 178/2014.
17   Article 25, paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants.

specific requirements for that position.[18] If a vacancy is not filled on the basis of a transfer, state authorities are obliged to announce internally such position with the purpose of promoting lower-level civil servants to a higher position.[19] However, at the beginning of a year, the Government may decide to use the public competition procedure for up to 20 percent of all vacancies, to ensure inflow of new human resources from the labour market – people with appropriate skills and knowledge for those positions. Public competitions are announced periodically for several positions at once (the so-called *pool recruitment*).

Recruitment commissions: The Law on Civil Servants has introduced permanent recruitment commissions with a term of office of one year. These commissions comprise one employee of the Public Administration Unit, one civil servant from the authority that fills a vacancy, and one external expert, normally a member of university staff.

Selection process: The selection is based on a written test, oral test or other selection methods, along with the assessment of work experience.[20] Successful candidates must exceed the 70% threshold of the total number of points that may be obtained, in which case they are included on the list of successful candidates.[21] The results of interviews account for 25% of the total number of points scored.

Appointments: Those included on the list of successful candidates, starting from the the highest-ranked person, can choose to be appointed to one of the vacant positions. If there are more successful candidates than vacant posts, they can be recruited once a new position becomes vacant within the period of next two years.[22] If, in the meantime, another recruitment procedure is organised for the same category of jobs, all successful and not appointed candidates will be re-rated in accordance with the new competition requirements.[23]

Senior managerial positions: The appointment to senior managerial positions requires that candidates have completed a comprehensive training course provided by the Albanian School of Public Administration.[24] Only middle-level

---

18   Article 25, paragraph 4 of the Law on Civil Servants.
19   Article 26, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.
20   Article 20, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.
21   Article 22, paragraph 5 of the Law on Civil Servants.
22   Article 23, paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants.
23   Article 23, paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants.
24   Article 27, paragraph 4 of the Law on Civil Servants. The sole exception to this rule was made immediately after the adoption of the Law – when the first class of students was still in school the so top-level management positions were filled through a competition.

civil servants who meet specific requirements can apply for this training when the School announces a national competition. The Law, however, makes an exception to this rule, by allowing the Government to identify situations in which other candidates, outside the public administration, are eligible for the training. The selection of candidates for senior managerial positions is conducted by the National Selection Committee.[25] The candidates who scored the highest and exceeded the 70 percent threshold are appointed to senior managerial positions and, at the same time, they become members of the category of senior managerial positions. Persons who complete training for senior managerial positions, subject to their consent, may also be appointed to positions of special coordinators and middle-level management.

Performance appraisal: The performance of civil servants is appraised annually, on the basis of the work objectives set at the beginning of the year and the results obtained. There are four performance appraisal rating categories: a) very good, b) good, c) satisfactory, and d) non-satisfactory.[26] The senior managerial staff is appraised by the National Selection Committee.[27]

Promotion: Promotions to higher positions are based exclusively on internal competitions. The internal competition procedure is regulated more thoroughly by a decree adopted by the Government.

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the Law and are the same for senior managerial positions and other civil servants.

3.2. BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA

Primary legislation: Law on Civil Service in the Government Institutions of Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH);[28] Law on Civil Service of the Federation of the Bosnia and Herzegovina (FBiH);[29] Law on Civil Servants of the Republic of Srpska (RS).[30]

---

25 The National Selection Committee comprises one representative of the Department of Public Administration, two representatives of the Albanian School of Public Administration, one representative of the top-level management staff and five independent experts. Article 31 of the Law on Civil Servants.

26 Article 62, paragraph 2, of the Law on Civil Servants.

27 Article 62, paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants.

28 *Official Gazette of the BiH*, Nos. 19/02, 35/03, 4/04, 17/04, 26/04, 37/04, 48/05, 2/06, 32/07, 43/09, 8/10, 40/12, 93/17.

29 *Official Gazette of the FBiH*, Nos. 29/03; 23/04; 39/04; 54/04; 67/05; 08/06; 04/12, 99/15; Constitutional Court Decision of 28 June 2016.

30 *Official Gazette of the RS*, Nos. 79/2005, 81/2005 – amended, 83/2005 – amended, 64/2007, 67/2007 – amended, 116/2008, 104/2009, 99/2014, 57/16.

Initiating recruitment process: At the BiH state level and in the BiH entity of FBiH, it is required that vacancies first be announced internally. Public competition is announced only in case that internal competition was not successful. In the BiH entity RS, internal competition does not need to precede the public competition.

Recruitment commissions: At the BiH state level, the competition procedure is carried out by a five-member recruitment commission – two members are proposed by the institution that is filling in vacancies, and three members are appointed by the Civil Service Agency from their list of experts.[31] The situation is similar in the FBiH, where the selection procedure is carried out by a commission made out of minimum three members – one representative of state authority that is filling in vacancies, one representative of a union, and one independent expert from the list of experts. The recruitment commission in the RS is comprised of three civil servants from the institution that is filling in vacancies and two experts from the list of experts.

Selection process: The applicants in a public competition at all levels are required to pass an exam on the public administration system in general, covering constitutional questions and questions related to employment in the public administration authorities, administrative procedure, dispute, and the like.[32] The objective of this examination is to identify if an applicant for a civil servant vacancy possesses an adequate level of knowledge in the field of public administration, necessary for the performance of civil servants' duties. Each level organises the examination in their own way. The state professional exam[33] is a special requirement in the Republic of Srpska for applying to all civil service vacancies.

At the BiH state level and in the FBiH, in the second stage of the selection process, applicants need to pass a more specific professional examination, both written and oral. At the BiH state level, the written part of the professional examination is comprised of four essay-type questions. All five members of the Commission evaluate the written part of the test. The highest and the lowest marks are not taken into account. What is used is the average mark from the remaining three. Minimum score for passing this part of test is 75%. In the FBiH, written tests are based on multiple choice questions, where the applicant needs to select one of the offered options. Minimum score for

---

31 Article 26, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Service in the Government Institutions of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

32 This exam, conducted in different forms (using multiple-choice tests or orally) is also referred to differently: public examination at the BiH state level; general knowledge examination in the FBiH; civil servants exam in the RS.

33 Pursuant to Article 29, paragraph 1, point b 2) of the Law on Civil Servants.

passing the written part of the test within the FBiH is 70%. The RS does not require a written test. As a follow-up of the written examination, an important part of the selection procedure at all three levels is the interview, which has yet to be standardised.

Appointments: For non-managerial posts at the BiH state level, the Agency for Civil Service automatically appoints the best applicant on the basis of the results achieved in the testing process. In the FBiH, the Minister or another competent person has the mandate to select any applicant from the list of successful applicants. In the RS, the Civil Service Agency proposes to the head of the state authority (that initiated a public competition) and recommends appointing the applicant with the best results.

Senior managerial positions: The selection of candidates for senior managerial positions at the state level of BiH is based on written examinations and interviews. The number of questions in the written test is double that for lower-ranking civil servants.[34] The Commission proposes to the respective authority the list of all candidates who have successfully passed the tests, which has to be approved by the Civil Service Agency. The management of the competent authority has the right to select any of the short-listed candidates.[35] If the appointment is not confirmed in this way within 30 days from the receipt of the Agency's conclusion and the short-list of successful candidates, the Agency appoints the most successful applicant *ex officio*.[36] In the RS, selection of top civil servants is performed in the same manner as the selection of other civil servants, that is, on the basis of the interview results.

Performance appraisal: At the BiH state level and in the RS, civil servants' performance is appraised once every six months, while in the FBiH, it is appraised annually. At all three levels performance is appraised on the basis of the objectives set at the beginning of the year and on the basis of demonstrated competences (such as, for example, independence, creativity, adaptability, etc.). There are four performance appraisal rating categories: a) very good, b) good, c) satisfactory, and d) non-satisfactory. Appraisal of

---

34 Rulebook on Announcement Procedures, Selection of Applicants, Transfer and Appointment of Civil Servants, Article 15, paragraph 4, *Official Gazette of the BiH,* Nos. 27/08, 56/09, 54/10.

35 Law on Civil Service in the Government Institutions of BiH, Article 28, paragraph 2. This procedure differs from the procedure applied in case of civil servants in other positions when the Agency for Civil Service appoints a civil servant on the basis of results achieved during the selection process. See Article 28, paragraph 1 of the Law on Civil Service in the Government Institutions of BiH.

36 Article 28, paragraph 3, of the Law on Civil Service in the Government Institutions of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

managerial civil servants is performed in the same manner as appraisal of other civil servants.

Promotion: At the BiH state level and in the FBiH, promotions to higher positions are exclusively based on internal competition. In the RS promotions are based on performance appraisal, provided there is a vacancy as defined by the Rules of Procedure on Internal Organisation and Systematisation and the Human Resources Plan.

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the Civil Service Law of all three levels and are the same for senior managerial positions and other civil servants.

3.3 KOSOVO*

Primary legislation: Law on Civil Servants of the Republic of Kosovo*.[37]

Initiating recruitment process: Vacancies are filled through a public competition. In order for the recruitment process to begin, the institution filling the vacancy has to obtain an approval of the Ministry in charge of the civil service. After obtaining the approval, the institution filling the vacancy advertises the competition in daily newspapers and through electronic media.[38]

Recruitment commissions: The selection process is carried out by an *ad hoc* commission appointed by the manager of the institution in question, in cooperation with the Ministry in charge of the civil service.[39] The Commission has five members who are all civil servants in the public authority conducting the competition, and the members must be of higher rank than the position advertised (it is allowed for one member to be in the same rank). If the position is a managerial one, the recruitment commission is formed by the Ministry in charge of the civil service.[40]

Selection process. Before evaluating an application, the recruitment commission first verifies its authenticity and the supporting evidence.

---

37   Law on Civil Servants of the Republic of Kosovo*, No. 03/L-149. adopted on May 13, 2010, *Official Gazette* No. 5 of June 25, 2010.

38   Articles 14, 15 and 17 of Ordinance No. 02-2010 on the recruitment process in the civil service.

39   Article 18, paragraph 8 of the Law on Civil Service.

40   The recruitment commission for managerial positions includes three Secretary Generals, one university professor and one civil sector representative. Two members of the commission are appointed by the head of the institution in which the vacancy is filled.

Applications are evaluated based on several criteria: the candidate's education and professional qualifications; work experience; skills; and other relevant factors. Maximum score for each of the four criteria is 20 points, and the minimum necessary for the second round of evaluation is 40 points.[41] In order for the selection process to continue, at least three candidates have to pass the first round of evaluation.

The follow-up selection process comprises a written test and an interview. The commission is required to prepare 30 to 50 questions for the written test, which include the following: 1) 3–5 essay-type questions on general knowledge: 2) 10–15 more specific questions on general knowledge and personality, intended to test the intellectual capacity of analytical thinking and reasoning, 3) 15–23 questions on knowledge in the work area related to the announced vacancy, half of which are essay-type, while the other half are multiple-choice questions 4) a foreign language test for positions that require knowledge of a foreign language.[42] Candidates who pass the written test are subsequently interviewed. The interview covers the following three issues: 1) personal suitability and professional ambitions (interests, career plans, psychological readiness, etc.); 2) general institutional and economic knowledge, and 3) competence/knowledge related to the position to be filled. The total score is calculated as the average score in the written test and in the interview. Successful candidates are those who achieve at least 60% of the maximum possible score.[43]

Appointments. The Commission forwards the results of the competition to the person in charge of human resources, who checks whether the procedure was conducted properly and forwards the list of successful candidates to the manager of the institution[44] who is obliged to select one of the candidates from that list.[45]

Senior managerial positions. Candidates for senior managerial positions are recruited primarily throgh promotion of lower-ranking civil servants. However, if there are no interested candidates within the civil service, that is, if the candidates who have applied for the position do not meet the requirements, a public competition is announced and conducted.[46] The selection procedure is based on a public competition and carried out in the same way as that for other civil servants. Once the selection process has been concluded, the

---

41   Article 28 of the Ordinance No. 02-2010.
42   Article 36 of the Ordinance No. 02-2010.
43   Article 40 of the Ordinance No. 02-2010.
44   Article 4 of the Ordnance No. 07-2010 on appointment of civil servants.
45   Article 7 of the Ordinance No. 02-2010.
46   Article 18 paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants.

commission proposes the three best candidates to the Ministry in charge of public administration. The Ministry forwards the list of successful candidates to the manager of the institution that is filling the managerial position. The manager selects one candidate from the list, who is then appointed to the position by the Government, for a three-year period.[47] An important role in the recruitment process monitoring and streamlining the senior management staff's work is vested with the Senior Civil Servants Council, comprised of the Deputy Prime Minister, Minister of Public Administration, Minister of Finance, Minister of the Communities, and three members who hold the position of Secretary General.[48]

Performance appraisal: Civil servants' performance appraisal includes two basic elements: achieved work objectives and competences.[49] Achievement of work objectives amount to 60% of the overall appraisal, while the remaining 40% of the overall appraisal is the appraisal of competences. Appraisal is based on a one to five scoring system, and the overall appraisal grade is descriptive (excellent, very good, good, satisfactory, and weak). It is interesting that the Kosovo* system prescribes mandatory performance appraisal quotas. Namely, the Ordinance on performance appraisal prescribes that only 5% of civil servants may be appraised "excellent", 15% may be appraised "very good", and 30% "good".[50]

Promotion: In the Kosovo* civil service system, promotion to higher positions is based on internal competitions. The internal competition is first advertised at the level of the organisational unit in the institution that needs to fill the vacancy. If the number of candidates who apply is insufficient (fewer than three), the competition becomes open for all the employees in the institution.[51] The provisions on the public competition procedure apply also to internal competitions.[52]

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the in the Law on Civil Servants and the secondary legislation.[53]

---

47   Article 15 of the Law on Civil Servants; Ordinance No. 06/2010 on the procedures for appointment to senior managerial position in the civil service of the Republic of Kosovo*.

48   Article 7 of Ordinance No. 06/2010.

49   The competences of non-managerial civil servants are as follows: expert technical knowledge; initiative and creativity; teamwork; communication and presentation skills; and work efficiency. The performance appraisal criteria for senior civil servants are as follows: planning and organisation; decision-making; employee motivation; and equal treatment of employees. See Article 6 of Ordinance No. 19/2012 on civil servants' performance appraisal.

50   Article 8 of Ordinance 19/2012.

51   Article 5 of Ordinance No. 12/2012 on civil servants' career advancement.

52   Article 7 of Ordinance 21/2012.

53   Ordinance No. 06/2010 for senior civil servants.

3.4. MACEDONIA

Primary legislation: Law on Administrative Servants.[54]

Initiating recruitment process: Administrative servants are recruited through a public competition.

Recruitment commissions: The selection procedure is carried out by a commission appointed by the director of the Administration Agency, an independent public authority accountable to the Macedonian parliament for its work.[55] The Commission is comprised of a representative of the Agency's unit for selection of candidates, the manager of the human resource management unit of the institution at which the vacancy is to be filled,[56] the manager of the organisational unit in which the vacancy is to be filled, and an official from the Secretariat for Implementation of the Ohrid Agreement.

Selection process: The competition procedures comprise four phases. These phases are preceded by a technical examination of the applications, in which the applications of candidates who do not meet the requirements are dismissed. In the first phase of the selection, the following professional qualifications of the candidates are assessed: relevant professional experience, knowledge of foreign languages, and knowledge of software necessary for office-related tasks. After assessing these criteria, the Commission draws up a list of the ten top-rated candidates who enter the second phase of selection.[57] The second phase consists of taking a written test, which comprises two parts: 1) assessment of professional knowledge, in which the knowledge of the Macedonian constitutional organisation, local self-government system, administrative procedures, administrative dispute, etc., is tested, and 2) assessment of personality and intellectual capacity, carried out by applying computer-based psychological tests.[58] The following, third phase of selection consists of an assessment of the validity of the evidence supporting the application, and of an interview. Prior to the interview, the Commission is under the obligation to verify the validity of the documents the candidates have attached to their application. The interview is used to check the general competences required for working in the vacant

---

54   Law on Administrative Servants – consolidated text, *Official Gazette of RM*, No. 142 of August 1, 2016. Administrative servants are persons who carry out administrative jobs both in administrative bodies and in local self-government bodies, and in public services such as agencies, funds, public institutions on local and republican level. See Article 3 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

55   Article 13 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

56   If there is no human resource unit, the member of the commission shall be the person in charge of human resources in the administrative body in which the vacancy is filled.

57   Article 39 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

58   Article 40 and Article 41 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

position, and the special competences that are required in accordance with the job description.[59] The candidates who have obtained at least 60% of points in the written test and the interview pass on to the final phase of selection. The last, fourth selection phase comprises a personality test, which checks social skills, certain aspects of a person's integrity, personal potential, etc. The names of the candidates who successfully pass the latter test are included in the final ranking of successful candidates.[60]

Appointments: The recruitment commission chooses the best candidates from the list and proposes them in ranked order to the institution in which a vacancy is to be filled. The number of candidates who will be appointed depends on the number of openings envisaged in the institution's annual work plan.[61] The manager of the institution is under the obligation to make a decision on the appointment within five days.

Senior managerial positions: Senior managerial positions include two categories: Category A – Secretary Generals, and Category B – managing administrative personnel. The verification of a candidate's competences for a managerial position is identical to the one that applies to two other categories of positions – expert administrative servants (Category V) and assisting expert administrative servants (Category G). This means that the selection processrules, outlines above, are also applicable for senior managerial positions.

Performance appraisal: Performance appraisal criteria established by law are as follows: quality, work efficiency and effectiveness; observance of deadlines and level of accomplishment of established working objectives and tasks; level of involvement and dedication to work; contribution to realisation of the institution's strategic plan, realisation of the individual plan of professional advancement, and actual behaviour. The performance appraisal is carried out once a year, at the latest, by December 1 for the current year; semi-annual interviews (by May 31 of the current year at the latest) are also mandatory. The appraisers can grade the personnel on a scale from one to five, while the overall annual grade is descriptive (A, B, C, G and D). Interestingly, in Macedonia, unlike the other countries in the region, the grading is done not only by the employee's superior but also by his/her associates and persons outside the institution. The grade given by the superior amounts to 65% of the overall grade, while the remaining 35% is comprised by the average grade of the other four administrative servants with whom the appraised employee cooperates at work, and by two persons

---

59   Article 42 of the Law on Administrative Servants.
60   Article 43 of the Law on Administrative Servants.
61   Article 44 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

who are not employed at the institution concerned but with whom the civil servant cooperates[62].

Promotion: Promotion to a higher position is done through an internal competition. The selection procedure has two phases: administrative selection and interview. The administrative selection is based on the three last annual performance appraisals, and also on the professional training attended and mentorship-work conducted. Based on the results of the administrative selection, the commission draws up a list including five top-rated candidates, and then conducts interviews with them. Following the interviews, the commission draws up a final list of candidates and proposes the top-rated candidate to the Secretary General, that is, the manager of the institution, who makes the decision. If the top-rated candidate is not appointed, such a decision must be justified.[63]

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the Law and are the same for senior civil servants and other civil servants.[64]

3.5. MONTENEGRO

Primary legislation: The Law on Civil Servants and Employees.[65]

Initiating recruitment process: Civil service vacancies in Montenegro are first filled through internal vacancy announcement within the same administration body. If a vacant post has not been filled in this manner, internal vacancy announcement within public authorities is mandatory, and if a vacant post cannot be filled in this manner either, public a is used.[66] Senior managerial positions are always filled by public competition.[67]

Recruitment commissions. Recruitment commissions are comprised of one representative of the Human Resources Management Authority, one representative from the public authority that announces a vacancy, and one professional evaluator for specific skills.[68] In cases of recruitment for senior

---

62 Articles 65 and 67 of the Law on Administrative Servants. If the civil servant does not come into contact with persons outside the institution at which he/she works, other appraisers are administrative servants of any level.

63 Articles 51 and 52 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

64 Article 98 of the Law on Administrative Servants.

65 The Law on Civil Servants and Employees, *Official Gazette of Montenegro*, Nos. 39/11, 50/11, 66/12, 34/14, 53/14 and 16/16.

66 Article 38, paragraphs 2–5 of Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

67 Article 38, paragraph 1 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

68 Article 42, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

managerial position, the professional evaluator needs to be a reputable expert in the field of the public authority and activities where a vacancy is to be filled.[69]

Selection process. Candidate selection is based on a written exam and an interview, but it can also be done in a different manner if it is appropriate.[70] The Commission evaluates candidates on the basis of an competency test and the information on their professional and work qualifications, obtained from their previous employers (if a candidate has any previous work experience), as well as on the basis of the grade point average and duration of studies.[71] The Commission prepares a report on the basis of which a list of shortlisted candidates is drawn up, which is then submitted to the manager of the public administration authority. The list includes five top-rated candidates.

Appointments. The manager (head) of the public administration authority, as a rule, selects the best-rated candidate from the shortlist. However, in exceptional circumstances, after having interviewed all the shortlisted candidates, the head of the authority may select another candidate from the list of candidates, but such a decision needs to be justified in writing.[72] When deciding on the selection of candidates, the manager is obliged to take into account the proportional representation of ethnic minorities and groups, gender-balanced representation, and employment of persons with disabilities.[73]

Senior managerial positions: The evaluation of candidates' competences for senior managerial positions is based on a structured interview.[74] Similar to the selection of other civil servants, the selection commission proposes a list of five candidates to the Minister, who then, as a rule, proposes the best-rated candidate to be appointed by the Government. However, the Minister may also select another candidate from the list, but has to justify it in writing.

Performance appraisal: Performance appraisal criteria are as follows: accomplished work results, independence and creativity in performing duties, quality of cooperation with clients and associates at work; quality of work organisation of conducting affairs, as well as other merits, skills, and qualities related to how work is carried out.[75] Civil servants' performance is

---

69   Article 53, paragraph 3 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
70   Article 42, paragraph 4 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
71   Article 43, paragraph 1 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
72   Article 45, paragraphs 2 and 3 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
73   Article 45, paragraph 4 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
74   Article 53, paragraph 5 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.
75   Article 108 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

appraised annually, at the latest, by 31st of January for the previous year.[76] Performance appraisal criteria for senior managerial positions are as follow: 1) work organisation of the organisational unit or sphere; 2) management quality; 3) level of accomplished relations and cooperation with citizens, public authorities and other subjects, non-governmental organisations and media 4) other merits and skills, as well as quality of obtained results.[77]

Promotion: Promotions to higher positions (as mentioned earlier) are made in different ways: 1) through internal competition within the public authority concerned, and if that competition is not successful, 2) through internal announcement among all public authorities and finally, if the vacancy is not filled in that way, 3) through public competition. In addition to a promotion to higher-ranked position, civil servants can be promoted into a higher salary class within the same position if, during a period of two years, their performance has been appraised as "excellent".[78]

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the Law[79] and are the same to top-level management and other civil servants.

3.6. SERBIA

Primary legislation: Law on Civil Servants.[80]

Initiating recruitment process: Civil service vacancies in Serbia may initially be filled by a simple transfer of civil servants to a vacant position within the same authority or within another authority (with a possibility of promotion). There is also an option to carry out an internal competition within the respective authority or the entire civil service, which, however, is not mandatory. If the vacancy is not filled in either of these ways, public competition is mandatory.[81] Vacancies for managerial positions must be filled through either internal or public competition.[82]

Recruitment commissions: Candidate selection is carried out by a commission, which is usually comprised of two civil servants from the

---

76   Article 109, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

77   Article 111 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

78   Article 112 of the Law Civil Servants and Employees.

79   Articles 121–126 of the Law on Civil Servants and Employees.

80   Law on Civil Servants, *Official Gazette of RS*, Nos. 79/2005, 81/2005, 84/2005, 64/2007, 67/2007, 116/2008, 104/2009 and 99/2014.

81   Law on Civil Servants, Article 49 – order of actions in the process of filling executive positions in all public authorities.

82   Law on Civil Servants, Article, 66, paragraph 2.

respective authority and one civil servant from the Human Resources Management Service. In case of selection of senior managerial positions, the recruitment commission is established by the High Civil Servants Council (HCSC)[83] and is usually comprised of two members of the HCSC and one outside expert, or alternatively a civil servant from the public authority in which the vacant position is to be filled.[84]

The selection process: The recruitment commission has the right to choose the selection method, which may include written examination, interview or any other appropriate measure.[85] A quite common procedure consists of psychological tests assessing personal suitability and competences (such as analytical thinking, logical inference, organisational skills, and the like). If a candidate passes this test, he/she is seen fit to enter the following phase of selection process, i.e., an interview with the Commission. Final candidate rating depends exclusively on interview results, as psychological test results are eliminatory and are not taken into consideration for the final rating. After the conducted interview, the recruitment commission lists a maximum of three candidates with the highest scores.[86]

Appointments. The head of the public authority in question is obliged to choose one of the candidates from the proposed list,[87] without a possibility to annul the list and initiate a new competition.

Senior managerial positions. During the selection process for senior managerial positions, the candidates are assessed on the basis of the content of their application, their knowledge and competences.[88] In addition to testing technical sectoral knowledge of a candidate (related to the area of activities of the institution or authority to which the vacancy belongs, and to relevant EU law), the selection process also includes competency testing. Competences that may be tested include analytical thinking, logical

---

83   High Civil Service Council is an expert body of the Government with the task to identify professional qualifications, knowledge and skills evaluated during the selection process and methods for their verification. The Council also prescribes criteria for recruitment to positions and adopts Civil Service Code of Conduct. High Civil Service Council has eleven members, appointed by the Government to a six-year term. Five members are appointed from experts in the fields important for the functioning of the public administration, and the remaining six members are appointed from civil servants proposed by the Minister competent for administrative affairs.

84   Law on Civil Servants, Article 68, paragraph 2.

85   Article 56, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.

86   Article 16 of the Rulebook on Professional Qualifications, Knowledge and Skills Evaluated in the Appointment Procedure, Methods for Evaluation and Criteria for Appointment to Positions, *Official Gazette of the RS*, Nos. 64/2006, 81/2006, 43/2009, 35/201.

87   Article 57, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.

88   Articles 18, 19 and 20 of the Rulebook on Professional Qualifications, Knowledge and Skills Evaluated in the Appointment Procedure, Methods for Evaluation and Criteria for Appointment to Positions.

reasoning, communication skills, organisational and management skills.[89] Logical and analytical reasoning, organisational skills and management skills are evaluated at the beginning of the selection process, using standardised tests. Evaluation of the candidates' knowledge and the professional capacity is carried out through an interview. Each member of the commission uses marks evaluates on a scale from 1 to 3 the information provided in the application and the answers to questions asked by the recruitment commission according to a predefined list of questions.[90]

At the end of the recruitment process, the commission proposes a list of maximum three candidates with the highest scores and the Minister has the power of discretion: to select one or none of them. The Minister, then, proposes the selected candidate from the proposed list to the Government, which makes the formal appointment. The Minister is not obliged to select any proposed candidate, but must justify such a decision to the High Civil Servants Council and the Human Resource Management Service.[91] If the Minister decides not to accept any of the proposed candidates, a new competition has to be conducted.

Performance appraisal: Civil servants' performance is appraised annually. Performance appraisal criteria for all positions are as follows: achievement of annual work objectives; independence and creativity; initiative; precision and diligence of work; quality of cooperation with other civil servants and other skills that are required for the position.[92] There are five performance appraisal rating categories: a) outstanding b) distinction c) good d) satisfactory, and e) non-satisfactory.[93] In case that a civil servant is appraised as "non-satisfactory", he/she is sent for additional professional training, and then re-evaluated after a period of 90 days. In case that the civil servant is appraised as "non-satisfactory" for the second time, his/her employment is terminated.[94]

Promotion: A civil servant may be promoted on the basis of a decision by a manager, if he/she has been obtained "outstanding" appraisal for two consecutive years, or "distinction" appraisal for four consecutive years. The

---

89   Article 19, paragraph 3 of the Rulebook.

90   Mark 3 is given to a candidate who fully meets the requirements for appointment, mark 2 is given to a candidate who partially meets the requirements for appointment, and mark 1 is given to a candidate who does not meet the requirements for appointment. A candidate's score is calculated as the average mark obtained by a candidate, except in the case when a member of Competition Commission has given mark 1 to a candidate, Article 20, paragraphs 3, 4 and 5 of the Rulebook.

91   Article 71, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.

92   Article 82, paragraph 2 of the Law on Civil Servants.

93   Article 84, paragraph 1 of the Law on Civil Servants.

94   Articles 85–86 of the Law on Civil Servants.

Law also provides for a promotion in case a civil servant has preciously obtained two "outstanding" appraisals and one "distinction" appraisal in a three-year period.[95]

Termination of employment: Conditions for termination of employment are listed in the Law[96], including special reasons for termination of employment for positions. These are also defined in detail in the Law on Civil Servants.[97]

4. WHAT ARE THE KEY ISSUES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE LEGAL FRAMEWORK COMMON TO WESTERN BALKAN COUNTRIES AND HOW TO OVERCOME THEM?

The summary of the legal framework governing the HRM system in the countries in the region shows that all key elements of modern human resource management are included in the regulatory framework. What is frequently missing, however, is adequate and effective implementation of the rules. Recently conducted analyses in the countries in the region show that HRM rules are applied in order to satisfy the formal requirements, but often do not achieve the desired practical effects.[98] Such formalism is notable in recruitment and selection and performance appraisal procedures, and to a certain extent also in training procedures, where considerable attention is given to the planning and delivery of training, but without effective instruments for tracking training effectiveness, that is, the effect that the training has on the civil servants' performance in practice.

One of the main problems in the recruitment and selection process lies in the fact that job descriptions (from rulebooks on internal organisation and staffing plans) normally do not provide a good basis for initiating recruitment and carrying out the selection process. Job descriptions are an instrument that in principle should help give visibility to the expected

---

95   Article 88 of the Law on Civil Servants.

96   Articles 126–132 of the Law on Civil Servants.

97   Articles 76–81 of the Law on Civil Servants.

98   P. Miklic *et al*, "Analysis of HRM in the Civil Service in BIH", September 2014, report prepared at the project *Modernisation of HRM in the Civil Service*, financed by the EU; Sahling J. M *et al*, "Improving the Implementation of Merit Recruitment Procedures in the Western Balkans: Analysis and Recommendations", paper presented at the RESPA conference in Danilovgrad, November 2015. D. Droli, F. Ohaja, "Discussion paper: Kosovo* Civil Service Reform", paper prepared for a round table on civil service, http://www.mei-ks.net/repository/docs/Discussion_Material_Civil_Service_Reform.pdf.

contribution of each employee in an organisation. In practice, there is often a considerable gap between a given job description and what a person in that job actually does or is expected to do. This is usually a consequence of dated rulebooks on internal organisation and staffing (for example, when rulebooks have not been changed in a long period of time) but also a lack of a proper job analysis that could be used as the basis for preparing good job descriptions.

Table 5. What is job analysis?

A job analysis is a process that includes collection and analysis of information about civil service jobs with the primary aim to prepare valid and high-quality job descriptions. Information may include the purpose of a particular job within the organisation, the main tasks and responsibilities to be carried out, as well as the educational level, experience and skills (competences) required to perform these tasks and responsibilities. Section 5.1 of this chapter provides more information about the concept of job analysis, its importance and good practice in the field.

Job descriptions in most civil service systems in the Western Balkans also do not list the all the competencies a civil servant should have in order to perform efficiently. Job descriptions should clearly define the knowledge and skills, both technical and behavioural, that a civil servant needs in order to effectively carry out his/her job (see Table 6. below). In most of the countries in the region, behavioural competences are still not included in the job descriptions.

Table 6. What are the Competences in the Civil Service?

Competences include knowledge, skills and behaviours needed for effective performance of a job in an organisation. Competences in the civil service can be technical and behavioural. Technical (or functional) competences include the knowledge necessary to perform a certain job (e.g., the knowledge necessary for being an accountant, lawyer, engineer, IT expert, etc.) and the technical skills necessary for the fulfilment of the particular role to be filled (e.g., project management, budget management etc.). Behavioural competences or *soft skills*, are equally important – for example, communication skills, integrity of an employee, the ability to work in a team, etc.

Both technical and behavioural competences should be identified in a job analysis and should constitute an integral part of the job description. The list of required competencies should take into account the purpose of the job and the most important tasks that constitute the job. While job descriptions in the countries of the Western Balkans normally do comprise technical competences (the professional knowledge required for the job), behavioural competences are normally not part of job descriptions. For this reason, specific technical competences (professional knowledge) are much more often tested during the selection process than the behavioural competences.

However, the importance of behavioural competences has been recognised. Most of the analysed countries have developed competency frameworks.[99] Competency frameworks include a wide spectrum of behavioural competences of civil servants, such as: professional development; problem-solving; achievement of results; communication; team work; management and leadership skills (for managerial positions). Behavioural competences of prospective candidates have also started to be tested during the selection process, as part of the general selection criteria. For example, in Montenegro, the written part of the selection process now tests the following competences of candidates for all jobs: analytical approach, accuracy, clarity and logic of expression, while communication skills are tested in the course of the interview.[100] In Serbia, the following competences are tested during the selection process: analytical thinking and logical reasoning, organisational skills, leadership skills (tested by standardised tests), and communication skills.[101] However, the mechanisms for assessment of competences at the various stages of the HRM process (and in particular during the interview in the selection process) are still not sufficiently developed.

As mentioned in the section dealing with European standards, one of the main guarantees of the implementation of the merit principle is the existence of a professional/competent and impartial competition committee/commission, the composition of which varies from country to country. Most of the analysed countries establish *ad hoc* commissions for each advertised post, comprising representatives from the public authorities in which the vacancy is to be filled, representatives from the central human resource management institution, and independent experts. In Albania, as described above, the new Law on Civil Servants has established permanent commissions with a one-year mandate.

It is interesting to note that, even in the countries in which the composition of the commission best guarantees the impartiality of its work – where the number of independent experts is significant – such experts are often under pressure to conform with the opinions of civil servants coming from the institutions in which the vacancies are to be filled.[102] This practice clearly indicates that in

---

99 See, for example, the competency framework of Macedonia presented in the Rulebook on Competences for Administrative Servants. Cf. The Rulebook on the Framework for General Working Competences for Administrative Servants, *Official Gazette of Macedonia* No. 142, adopted on 29/9/2014.

100 Article 13 and Article 15 of the Decree on the Ways to Test Abilities, Criteria and Assessment of Candidates for Carrying out Jobs in State Administration Body, *Official Gazette of Montenegro*, No. 04/13.

101 Article 9 of the Rulebook on Professional Capabilities, Knowledge and Skills Tested in the Selection Process and Selection Criteria, *Official Gazette of the Republic of Serbia*, Nos. 64/2006, 81/2006, 43/2009, 35/2010 and 30/2015.

102 A. Rabrenovic, A. Cesic, V. Vlajkovic, "Analysis of State of Play and Challenges in the Area of Recruitment and Selection of Civil Servants in the Civil Service Structures of BiH",

most countries in the region, a lack of objectivity in the recruitment process is frequently in conflict with the merit principle. This has proved to be a particular problem during the recent global economic crisis, as job safety, which is an important feature of civil service jobs, has been very important.

A significant problem related to the work of the recruitment commissions relates to the capacity of their members to carry out the selection process competently and on the basis of objective criteria and a neutral methodology. Recent research on the recruitment process in the Western Balkan countries shows that the work of the selection commissions is rated quite low in most analysed countries.[103] The insufficient competence of the members of these commissions is less prominent in permanent recruitment and selection commissions (e.g., in Albania), as they function for a longer period of time. Furthermore, the employees of central human resource management units (agencies, services) and human resource management units in the public authorities generally, do usually have the necessary knowledge to successfully conduct the selection process in accordance with the principles that should be applied.

The problem of the lack of competence of the selection commission members refers to members who perform this role occasionally, such as the representatives of the public authority in which the vacancy is announced or outside experts. The common practice is that experienced commission members, such as the representatives of the central civil service agencies or of human resource management units in public authorities, make an effort to give instructions to other commission members during the selection process. In most cases, however, this practice does not necessarily result in a better process, mostly due to the lack of time to explain the mechanisms of a correct selection process, which in turn does not rectify an inadequate understanding of the entire process.

Even though interviews are the most important part of the selection process in several countries, there are no instructions on how to conduct a competency-focused interview. Most of countries do have basic rules and procedures on how to conduct interviews (e.g., how many points to assign for a particular question, etc.). The problem, however, is that commission members do not know how to assess a candidate's competences (e.g., analytical thinking, communication skills, etc.), which considerably undermines the intended use of the merit principle in the selection process, both for managerial and non-managerial positions.

Sarajevo, July 2014, report prepared at the project *Modernisation of HRM in the Civil Service*, financed by the EU.

103 Sahling J. M *et al*, "Improving the Implementation of Merit Recruitment Procedures in the Western Balkans: Analysis and Recommendations", p. 23.

Bearing in mind that structured competency-based interviews, according to European experience, have proven to be a reliable indicator of success of new employees in their job performance, to apply structured competency-based interviews in all Western Balkan countries would be very useful. As mentioned in the section dealing with European standards, structured interviews imply that concrete questions to be used with all candidates should be decided in advance, and detailed notes should be taken during the interview to help determine the performance of each candidate and to compare the candidates. Furthermore, bearing in mind that the skill to prepare and ask good questions is not a natural talent, it is important for the commission members to undergo training that will teach them how to ask the right questions, enabling them to assess the candidates' competences that are of key importance for job performance.

In order to assist the competency testing process during the interview, section 5.2. of this chapter provides a list of questions that could be used by members of competition commissions. These questions are currently being used to test competences of prospective civil service candidates at the BiH state level.[104]

In the phase of selection based on a written examination, the main problem lies in the fact that the questions to be asked are frequently "leaked" to some or all candidates before the beginning of the testing. This problem is not easily overcome; however, one solution might be to ensure the candidates' anonymity through assigning a code to each candidate. The candidate would participate in all stages of the competition, up until the interview, under a code, which would promote objectivity and impartiality in the selection process, and also the protection of candidate's personal data. By giving the central human resource management institution the authority to manage the entire selection process, as is the case in Belgium, Spain and Portugal,[105] the abuse of position to assist a candidate during the selection process would be substantially reduced, or even eliminated. Such a decision, however, is at the heart of human resource management policy, and would depend on the Government in power.

In most of six countries analysed above, the discretionary powers of managers in the course of the recruitment and selection process may jeopardise the full implementation of the merit principle and, thus, the integrity of the process. The responsible manager of the recruiting institution often has considerable power to influence in all stages of recruitment, starting from the decision on whether there is a need to fill a particular vacancy to the final selection

---

104 Rulebook on Character and Content of Public Competition, Carrying out of the Interview and Interview Form, *Official Gazette of the BIH,* Nos. 63/16 and 21/17.

105 A. Rabrenovic, A. Cesic, V. Vlajkovic, p. 35.

of the candidate. In Serbia, Montenegro, BiH Federation, and until recently, in Macedonia, the manager had the right to select one of the candidates from the list of successful candidates, regardless of their internal ranking. The manager's right to not select the candidate ranked as number one is a serious problem, particularly as the manager does not need to explain and justify such a decision. Furthermore, in some countries there is no time limit set for the manager's decision on the selection of a candidate, which provides room for prolonging the entire procedure infinitely. That, in fact, may give the manager a free hand to obstruct the entire recruitment procedure. This problem, however, cannot be resolved without changing the regulations and reducing the manger's discretionary powers, while also introducing the obligation for the manager to select the candidate who was ranked first in the list of successful candidates.

Finally, one of the most important "bypasses" in the merit-based recruitment process is to engage a civil servant under a fixed-term employment contract, in which case there is no obligation to conduct any assessment of potential candidates.[106] Since there is no public announcement of the vacancy in the case of fixed-term employment, the vacancies are mostly reserved for candidates who have personal support within the institution concerned. A frequent practice is to publicly announce the vacancy for the given position after a certain time, and the person who is already employed under a fixed-term employment contract may then apply with a built-in advantage. Naturally, that person may win the competition more easily as he/she is already well acquainted with the job-related duties and responsibilities. In this way, temporary employment may be used as a strategy for giving a person a permanent civil service position. This is why it is important that the practice of fixed-term employment is restricted and only used in extraordinary circumstances.

A key recommendation related to improvements in the merit-based recruitment process is to invest in the professional competence and integrity of the recruitment and selection commission members. That seems particularly important concerning top officials and outside experts – they must clearly understand the professional requirements they are supposed to adhere to. A recent ReSPA study also recommends the development of easy-to-use manuals, organised training, more standardised evaluation forms, and introducing certification of knowledge in the field of recruitment and selection,[107] which should be taken into account in the efforts to strengthen the integrity of the recruitment process.

---

106 J. M. Sahling *et al*, p. 14.
107 *Ibid,* pp. 9–11.

The instrument of regularly assessing the performance of civil servants, through a formal appraisal process, has been institutionalised in all Western Balkan countries. Again, what is lacking in most of the countries is the capacity to effectively implement this instrument. In most of the countries, performance appraisal is seen primarily as an opportunity to reward or sanction a civil servant, rather than an instrument to help develop his/her full working potential.[108]

Civil servants mostly complain about the subjective nature of the performance appraisal process; in fact, it is heavily criticised and contested. The main objection is that the managers who serve as appraisers, or who have the main role in performance appraisal, do not have sufficient information on the work of a civil servant and are thus unable to objectively assess it. The result may often be a bad working environment, which adversely affects the morale of the entire organisation. To remedy such a negative situation, managers often resort to awarding high-level grades to the majority of their subordinates, which subsequently leads to inflation of grades.[109] Some countries (i.e., Kosovo*, as mentioned above) have introduced performance appraisal quotas, but that has apparently not yielded the expected results.[110] We may, therefore, question whether a complex performance appraisal system is worth the time and efforts that are invested in it.

Improving the effectiveness of performance appraisal is not an easy task and may require considerable time and efforts. First, it would be important to change the awareness about the purpose of performance appraisals – it should primarily be seen as a tool for promoting individual professional development, and not as a tool for rewarding or punishing a civil servant. Second, effective performance appraisal requires good managers (as appraisers) who would be well acquainted with the work of their subordinates and learn how to motivate them to exhibit their best performance. Third, performance appraisal of an individual civil servant should be seen against the performance of the whole organisation. In order to achieve this, work objectives of a civil servant should be linked to the objectives of the whole organisation. Forth, even with the best of efforts, performance appraisal of individual civil servants may indeed create "divisions" between civil servants, as some of them with the highest potential may be rewarded with the best marks, which may demotivate those who also work hard, but cannot achieve such a high level of performance and hence receive lower marks. For this

---

108 B. Stojanovic, A. Rabrenovic, *Manual on Performance Appraisal of Civil Servants: A Guide for Successful Performance Management in Civil Service Structures in BiH*, Djikic Consulting Services, PARCO, 2011.

109 J. Meyer-Sahling, "Sustainability of Civil Service Reforms in Central and Eastern Europe Five Years After EU Accession", p. 50.

110 We thank Florian Qehaja for the input on this matter.

reason, some countries consider introducing group performance appraisal instead of individual one.[111] Fifth, performance appraisal should also be better linked with other human resource management functions, especially with civil servants training. Performance appraisal may be a valuable tool to identify the training needs related to a person's concrete career aspirations, which is very important if there is a desire to keep good and ambitious people in the civil service.

Finally, we may conclude that despite constant modernisation efforts, human resource management in the Western Balkan countries is still, to some extent, understood and carried out in the traditional sense of "staff management". The traditional "staff management" function was to keep regular records of employees, draft and enforce rules, and file and keep files of all personnel. The HRM function is still not sufficiently recognised as a strategic tool that enables public authorities to achieve their objectives through a professional, competent and efficient civil service.

In order for human resource management to obtain strategic importance, as a means to advance institutional integrity and good governance, it is necessary to continuously raise awareness and increase the capacities of all key institutional actors, the top civil servants in particular. A frequent misconception is that in times of crisis, savings may be found in reduced investments in human capital – in public human resources. The truth is quite the opposite, since investing in human capital is the key to an effective public sector. Savings may be achieved by managing human resources efficiently, and that is what good HRM is all about.[112] Good managers are crucial for constructive change in any field of public administration, and in the field of human resources in particular. If managers stimulate change, change happens fast – if they oppose change, nothing is likely to change. It is, therefore, very important for managers to recognise the importance of good and competent human resource management, to respect and promote it. Managers often forget that HRM is a vital part of the generic description of any managerial job. For example, a responsibility they often tend to forget is to systematically develop the potentials and competences of their employees. This is why a focus on the managers' capacities is so important in all organisations, including public administration. If the managers have proper managing skills and pay the needed attention to employees' motivation and professional development, the organisation

---

111 World Bank, *International Public Administration Reform: Implications for the Russian Federation*, Washington DC, 2003.

112 P. Miklic *et al*, "Analiza upravljanja ljudskim potencijalima u državnoj službi u BiH", September 2014, report prepared on the Project *Modernisation of HRM in the Civil Service*, financed by the EU.

develops improved results, job satisfaction and morale in the organisation is increased, and the quality of services provided to citizens improved. This all results in strengthened professional integrity and improves the resistance to any form of corruption.

5. INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL PRACTICES THAT COULD BE USED FOR TRAINING OF CIVIL SERVANTS

5.1 JOB ANALYSIS[113]

5.1.1 Introduction

Job analysis is a process that includes collection and analysis of information about civil service positions with the primary aim to prepare high-quality job descriptions. Information is collected as a basis for the job analysis in order to define the purpose of a particular job within the organisation, its main tasks and responsibilities, as well as education level, experience and skills (competences) required to perform the tasks and responsibilities at that particular position.

Quality job analysis is important for any organisation because it represents the basis for other processes in the human resource management, such as:

- human resource planning (defining the future requirements for the job);
- recruitment and selection (preparing the specifications, i.e., the knowledge and skills that will serve as the basis for filling the position);
- performance appraisal (defining the factors that will be taken into account when determining the objectives and skills to be assessed);
- human resource development (providing information about the competences necessary for the work to be performed, which should be included in a training programme);
- development and maintenance of a computerised information system for human resource management (indicating what should be registered in the data base).

---

113 Text taken from the chapter: A. Rabrenović, V. Vlajkovic, D. Ahmetović, "Job Analysis and Analytical Job Evaluation", in *Human Resource Management in the Civil Service of Bosnia and Herzegovina (*P. Miklič, S. Godec eds.), T&T Koncept Sarajevo, 2015, 73–86.

The job analysis process comprises two main phases:

- data collection
- preparation of a job description.

5.1.2 Data Collection

Data collection is the first phase in job analysis and it includes compilation of different types of information pertaining to the position being analysed. Such information may be obtained by analysing the existing job description in the rulebook on internal organisation, organisational charts, as well as different procedures or instructions concerning the job. In addition to the analysis of relevant documents, information about the specific nature of a job may be obtained from interviewing the employees in the position or similar positions, that is, from civil servants who have practical experience in performing the tasks of a given position, including, if considered useful, from the immediate supervisor of the particular position.

Data collection, as well as other phases of job analysis, should be performed by the job analyst – an employee who works with HRM and organisational issues, or other employees selected by the head of the relevant public administration authority. The job analyst should collect all information that is relevant for the performance of tasks and responsibilities of a specific position and conduct interviews, as required, with civil servants who are familiar with the position and what it requires. A job analysis questionnaire that may be used as the basis for such interviews is found in Annex I of this chapter.

5.1.3 Preparation of Job Descriptions

A quality job analysis should provide the basis for an accurate and detailed job description. New trends in human potential development require job descriptions that provide sufficient information about the required qualifications and competences as that will inform training programmes. In addition to the technical information about a position (e.g., work post title, organisational unit, number of similar positions), it is necessary to specify clearly the purpose of the work and to describe the different tasks that particular position is meant to handle. That should include the concrete results that should be achieved, as well as the expected amount of time necessary for carrying out the different tasks. The job description should contain detailed information about a technical profile of the incumbent of the position, specifying the education level and work experience required, as well as necessary professional

knowledge, skills and competences (including personal characteristics). At the end, the job description should also contain the title/category of the work position in question, which should be commensurate with the qualifications and experience needed to fill the position. The format of the job description is presented below as a sample job description.

Purpose of work is a brief description why a particular civil service position exists and includes what the incumbent is expected to do and why. It is desirable to describe the purpose in a single sentence (usually up to 40 words). When defining the purpose, the following should be considered:

- Which part of the tasks/objectives of the public administration authority/organisational unit is performed through the position (from the rulebook on internal organisation and staffing, i.e. organisational charts)?
- What is the contribution of these tasks to the overall objectives of the organisational unit in comparison to other positions in the organisation?
- How may the above be summarised in one sentence as the overall responsibility of the position?

Description of tasks and responsibilities should be in accordance with the purpose of the position. Each position should represent one or several separate areas and the intended results should be in line with the purpose of the work. What is expected from the person who fills a particular position follows from that. Theory as well as practice indicates that most public positions comprise 5 to 9 specific tasks and responsibilities. Less than five tasks may indicate that something has been left out and more than nine tasks that more secondary and less important activities were included in the list.

When defining tasks and responsibilities, it is necessary to pay attention to the core functions that a position is expected to fulfil:

- all tasks and responsibilities should be linked in a realistic way to the key results expected from the incumbent of a given position;
- each position should be unique and represent a specific area in which the expected results should be achieved;
- each of the positions should be focused on *what* is required and not on *how* the work should be carried out;
- the tasks should be prioritised, starting from the most important ones for achieving the purpose of the work; this may often be a function of the amount of time necessary for their execution;
- the tasks and results should be defined in a measurable way, if possible.

Each of the tasks should be defined in line with the principle that "something needs to be done in order to achieve a certain result or standard". It is desirable that the description of tasks begins with words such as: preparing, creating, planning, organising, testing, maintaining, developing, supervising, providing, etc. Percentage of workload for each of the tasks and responsibilities should refer to a regular time period of twelve months. This information will help to categorise all jobs based on the most important and frequent tasks performed in a given job.

Contacts are to specify the main internal and external contacts of the incumbent at a given job and their purpose and frequency.

Requirements for a position include: education level, work experience, professional knowledge, skills and competences. In addition to the specification that should specify the education level and relevant work experience needed, professional knowledge and skills (such as, for example, knowledge of a specific subject area of relevance to the work, knowledge of foreign languages, technical knowledge such as computer programmes as proved by certification, etc.). This part of the job description should also provide an answer to the question which competences – knowledge, skills and behaviour – are necessary in order to perform the job efficiently.

Category/rank of a position is determined in accordance with an evaluation of where the position is placed in the organisation, the degree of independence of the work, the level of qualifications needed, etc., in line with the general methodology used in the civil service system.

5.1.4 Sample job description

Job Description

1. Main information about the work post

Institution:	*Ministry of Labour*
Title of work post:	*Head of Labour Inspection Section*
Sector/department/service:	*Labour Inspection Section*
Number of staff /number of targeted staff:	*1/1*
Title of immediate supervisory work post:	*Assistant Director – Chief Labour Inspector*
Title and number of directly subordinated work posts and staff members:	*13 labour inspectors*

2. Purpose of the work post:

Managing the Labour Inspection Section within the Department with the aim of efficient performance of inspection controls in the field of labour and work protection.

3. Work post tasks and responsibilities

Tasks and responsibilities	Percentage of workload
Conducting complex inspection controls, producing minutes, decisions and misdemeanour warrants in accordance with the control performed	30%
Cooperation with the chief inspector on preparation of inspection plans on monthly and annual level	20%
Cooperation with heads of field offices concerning the implementation and monitoring of implementation of the inspection operational plans	20%
Managing the Section, supervision of the work of inspectors and reporting to the Assistant Director on conducted inspection controls	10%
Entry of data into the IT system and production of reports on inspection controls	10%
Monitoring of regulations in the field of labour and work protection and harmonising best practices in the inspection	10%

4. Contacts:

Daily internal contacts with heads of field offices and chief inspector concerning the planning of implementation of inspection activities. Regular contacts with local labour inspectors with the aim of adequate delegation of tasks. Contacts on a weekly level with the Ministry of Labour, administrative inspectors, the police in order to exchange information with the aim of a more efficient control.

5. Requirements for the work post (education level, work experience, professional knowledge and skills, and competences):

Required education level, type and work experience	University degree – level VII, faculty of economics or law, 3 years of work experience in the field of inspection control
Required professional knowledge and skills	Law on Administrative Procedure, Labour Law, Law on Inspections, Law on Work Protection and other regulations, coordination of ideas and resources necessary to achieve the objectives, data analysis, making conclusions and resolving problems
Required competences	Communication, management, continued development, tactfulness, strategic planning and decision-making

5.2 CONDUCTING
A COMPETENCE-BASED INTERVIEW[114]

5.2.1 Questions that can be used to test competencies during the selection process

Competencies required for all civil servants

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
1.0 PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND INTEGRITY *The application and continuous acquisition of the necessary knowledge, skills and behaviours to achieve high levels of work performance, including the ability to transfer knowledge and experience to others.*	How do you keep yourself informed, adopt and apply new knowledge and skills relevant to your professional development?
1.1 Continuous acquisition of knowledge and skills necessary for the job Ensures they have the knowledge and skills necessary for the job, takes steps to find out if there are gaps/changes and then addresses them.	Tell me about a time when you realised that you did not have sufficient knowledge or skills to do a part of your job. What did you do? Tell me about a time when you learned something unexpected, which has since proved useful. How do you keep yourself up to date with factors influencing your field of expertise? How do you keep up to date on new developments in your field? What was the last occasion you did this and what was the development? How did this improve the service to your client(s) How do you keep up to date on new developments in your field? What was the last occasion you did this and what was the development? How did this improve the service to your client(s)

---

114 Material developed under the EU project "Modernisation of HRM Systems in the Civil Service". See: S. Williams, "Using a Competency Framework to Improve Recruitment and Selection", in *Human Resources Management in the Civil Service of Bosnia and Herzegovina* (P. Miklic, S. Godec eds.) T&T Koncept Sarajevo, 2015, 105–130. See also: Rulebook on Character and Content of Public Competition, Carrying out of the Interview and Interview Form, *Official Gazette of the BiH,* Nos. 63/16 and 21/17.

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	How do you keep up-to-date with current legislation and how it impacts on the institution and, more specifically, your job?
1.2 Commitment to personal and professional development Takes responsibility for personal and professional development, displaying motivation and a commitment to learning and self-improvement.	In the last year what steps have you taken to develop personally or professionally?
1.3 Knowledge sharing Shares knowledge and information gained with others so they can learn	When was the last time you shared some new information or learning with any of your colleagues? Tell me how you did this. Give me an example of when someone came to you for help or guidance. Why did they need your support? Tell me of a time when you had to work with someone less experienced than yourself.
1.4 Integrity Engenders the trust and respect of others through consistent honesty. Abides by the Civil Service Code of Conduct.	How do you gain the trust and respect of others? Give me a specific example. Describe a situation where you had to deal with an unpleasant or dissatisfied client. Tell me about a time when you showed integrity and professionalism. Tell us about a time when someone asked you something that you objected to. How did you handle the situation? Have you ever been asked to do something illegal, immoral or against your principles? What did you do? When have you had to lie or withhold the facts to achieve your aims? Why did you do so? How do you feel you could have achieved the same aim in a different way? Give me an example of a time when you had to work hard to build up a good relationship with other people (e.g. colleagues / clients). Tell me about a time when you realised that a fellow employee was breaking the rules of your organisation. What did you do?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
2.0 PROBLEM SOLVING, INITIATIVE AND CHANGE *The ability to act proactively and to respond positively, creatively and constructively to changing situations and new demands,*	Give us an example of when you took the initiative in your field of work.
2.1 Initiative Acts with initiative within his/her scope of work	Give us an example of a situation where you had to make a decision in the absence of your superiors but knowing you would be judged on your decision. When did you depart from the established policy to accomplish your goal? Which decisions do you feel able to make on your own and which do you require senior support to make? Have you ever gone beyond the limits of your authority in making a decision? If so, please let us about that situation.
2.2 Innovation of new work solutions Develops fresh ideas that provide solutions to workplace challenges; encourages new ideas and innovations; open to change.	Tell us about a situation where you trusted your team to derive a new approach to an old problem. How did you manage the process? Tell us about a time when you had to convince a senior colleague that change was necessary. What made you think that your new approach would be better suited? What is the most difficult problem you have had to resolve in the last 12 months? What made it difficult? What processes did you use to resolve the problem? Who else did you involve? What ideas have you identified to improve the way you work? How were these implemented? Give me an example of when you instigated a major change What initiated the change? How did you manage the impact on people? How did you communicate the changes? What methods do you adopt to elicit new ideas from others? Give me an example of when you changed your working practice to be more efficient. How did you know that an improvement was necessary? What steps did you take?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	Tell me about an occasion when you developed and implemented a new approach to organisational practices or processes What research did you undertake to inform your approach? What options did you identify? To what extent were you able to bring about change?
2.3 Creativity Develops creative insights into situations and questions conventional approaches	Tell us about a project or situation where you felt that the conventional approach would not be suitable. How did you derive and manage a new approach? Which challenges did you face and how did you address them? Give me an example of when you came up with a novel/different approach to a problem/ situation. What suggestions did you make? Which ideas were put into practice? What was the outcome?
2.4 Problem-solving skills Presents not just problems but proposes solutions to issues	What ideas have you developed and implemented that have impacted on the long-term development of your function? What were the challenges? What was the impact on your function's operation? How did you evaluate the effectiveness of these changes in the long term? What is the most difficult problem you have had to resolve in the last 12 months? What made it difficult? What processes did you use to resolve the problem? Who else did you involve?
2.5 Ability to resolve difficult or complicated challenges Resolves difficult or complicated challenges	When do you feel that it is justified for you to go against accepted principles or policy? Describe a situation when you came up with a solution to a problem. Tell me about a particularly difficult piece of work you have faced. How did you tackle it?
2.6 Helping others with change	Tell us about a time when you had to convince a colleague that change was necessary. What made you think that your new approach would be better suited? Give me an example of when you instigated a major change. How did you achieve that? How did you manage the impact on people? How did you communicate the changes? Tell me how you have accommodated operational change in your unit's activities

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
3.0 TEAMWORK *The ability to work well in groups and teams, to cooperate with other members and to contribute through active participation in order to achieve collective goals.*	Tell me about the last time you worked as part of a team. What did you do? How do you ensure that every member of the team is allowed to participate? Give me an example of how you dealt with a conflict in your team. Do you incline more to individual or team work? Please give us an example.
3.1 Building constructive working relationships Builds constructive working relationships through cooperation, acceptance and respect for others.	Tell me how you went about building an effective working relationship with a colleague/team. What effect did your actions have on the success of the team? How did you know? How do you build relationships with other members of your team? Give me an example of a time when you had to work hard to build up a good relationship with other people (e.g. colleagues / clients)
3.2 Facilitating teamwork Promotes cooperation and commitment within a team to achieve goals and deliverables	How did you encourage other team members to co-operate? Give me an example of when you helped improve the performance of your team. What improvement did you identify? How did this improve team performance? How do you ensure that every member of the team is allowed to participate?
3.3 Helping others resolve conflicts Helps others resolve complex or sensitive disagreements and conflicts	Describe a time when you had to win someone over, who was reluctant or unresponsive. Give us an example where you worked in a dysfunctional team. Why was it dysfunctional and how did you attempt to change things? Give an example of a time when you had to deal with a conflict within your team? What did you do to help resolve the situation? How do you bring difficult colleagues on board? Give us an example where you had to do this Give me an example of a difficult people situation that you have had to handle within your team. Tell me about a time when you found it very difficult to get the agreement of others to an important proposal. How did you tackle this?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
3.4 Respecting different points of wiew, and diverse orientations Respect of different points of view, openness to diversity.	How do you ensure that every member of the team is allowed to participate? Tell me about a time when you had to work closely with someone from a different social background, race, culture, or belief-system to yours. What were the challenges? How did you deal with them?
3.5 Ability to cooperate with other teams Builds and maintains constructive and productive relations with other teams and their members	Give me an example of when you have identified an opportunity to enhance a service by collaborating with another team. How did you identify that this was an opportunity? What was your role in developing effective partnership working? Give an example of when you have lead a team on a major project. How did you gain support for this activity beyond your immediate team? Describe a time when you have had to enlist the help of another department or group to complete a piece of work.

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
4.0 COMMUNICATION *The ability to communicate effectively both orally and in writing with managers, colleagues, clients and citizens, conveying information clearly, accurately and in a timely manner to relevant individual and groups.*	Tell us about an occasion when your communication skills made a difference to a situation? What is the worst communication situation that you have experienced? Tell us about a situation when you failed to communicate appropriately. Tell me about a particularly difficult message that you had to communicate to an individual or group. What steps did you take to ensure the message was clear? How did you ensure the message was understood?
4.1 Tactfulness Has patience and uses good judgment in communication, keeping polite behaviour in all interactions.	Please describe a situation where you've been tactful. Can you please describe a situation where you've been diplomatic? Describe a situation when someone has irritated you. How did you respond? Tell me about a situation when someone was very slow to respond to a request of yours. How did you deal with it?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
4.2 Clear conveying of ideas, facts and instructions Conveys ideas, facts and instructions, – orally or in writing – with clarity, using language the audience will best understand.	Describe a situation where you had to explain something complex to a colleague or a client. Which problems did you encounter and how did you deal with them? What type of writing have you done? Give examples please. What makes you think that you are good at it? How do you feel writing a report differs from preparing an oral presentation?
4.3 Active listening Listens, understands and learns from what others say.	Give us an example where your listening skills proved crucial to an outcome. Tell us about a time when you were asked to summarise complex points.
4.4 Encouraging feedback from others Encourages information feedback from others and offers it to other parties	Describe a situation when you have sought feedback from your clients (internal or external). Why did you seek this feedback? How did you gather the information? How did you use it to improve services? Tell me about an occasion when you had to adapt to a major change Why was it important? How did you adapt? How did you use feedback to improve your work?
4.5 Adaptive communication style Changes the communication approach and style to meet the preferences and needs of the audience	Demonstrate how you vary your communication approach according to the audience that you are addressing. Describe a situation where you had a disagreement or an argument with a superior. How did you handle it? Describe an occasion when you needed to adopt a particular approach to get agreement from others. Have you ever had to modify your personal communication style to achieve results with a difficult individual or group? Tell me how you did this.
4.6 Effective participation at meetings Conducts and/or participates in meetings and group discussions efficiently and with structure.	Tell me about an important meeting you have led or participated in. How did you prepare? What did you do during the meeting? Tell me about the most difficult meeting you have led/participated in. Why was it difficult? How did you deal with it?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
5.0 PERSONAL EFFECTIVENESS AND RESULTS ORIENTATION *Performing consistently at a high level. Achieving goals and continuously improving the quality of service to citizens, clients and other civil service functions and institutions.*	Tell me about a time when you have had to meet challenging client needs. Give me an example of where you found it necessary to change a process to meet client needs. What has been your biggest work achievement this year? How did you make it happen? Tell me about a time when you were able to improve a service to a client or another department.
5.1 Focusing on results and desired outcomes Focuses on results and desired outcomes and how best to achieve them. Produces good quality outputs with little oversight, on time.	When did you depart from the established policy to achieve results and the expected outcome. Describe a project or situation where you took a project to completion despite important opposition Describe an occasion when you have had to deliver a complex project on time and to budget. What were the objectives? What key stages did you work through? How did you get people on board? What were the difficulties you had to overcome? What obstacles do you encounter and how do you overcome them to achieve your objectives? What do you do to deliver your unit's goals? Tell me of a challenging goal you have set yourself. How do you organize your day-to-day workload? What tools or methods do you use? How does this take account of interruptions and changes to your plans? Give an example of when you have set a deadline and were unable to achieve it. What issues did you anticipate? How did you plan for these? What was the result? What if anything would you do differently next time? Tell me about a time in which you were required to produce something to a high standard, within a fixed period of time. Give me an example of where you found it necessary to change a process to meet client needs. Tell me about a time when you didn't meet an objective/deadline.

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
5.2 Building and maintaining client and citizen satisfaction Builds and maintains client and citizen satisfaction with the services offered by meeting or exceeding their expectations.	Describe a time when you exceeded a client's expectations. How did you know you had exceeded? What did your actions achieve? Describe a situation where you had to deal with a dissatisfied client. How did the client respond to the actions you took? What did you do to ensure that the situation did not occur again with other clients? Give us an example of when you have initiated the development of working relationships with external partners to improve the quality of service. Describe a key client relationship you have built. Describe a time when you were really satisfied with the service you had given to a client. Tell me of an occasion when a client has commented on service you provided.
5.3 Paying attention to detail Pays attention to detail and produces accurate results	Describe a time when you have made a mistake and the subsequent actions that you took. Tell me about a piece of work you produced where accuracy was essential. Give me an example of the ways you check the accuracy of your work. Tell me of a time when you have felt it necessary to consult with others for more detail
5.4 Efficient management of time and resources Improves productivity by managing time, priorities and resources to achieve goals and secure value for money	Give an example of when you have set a deadline and were unable to achieve it. What issues did you anticipate? How did you plan for these? What was the result? How do you currently ensure that you manage your resources effectively? How do you consider costs to the organisation? What environmental factors do you take into account? What factors do you need to take into account when planning your budgets? How do you plan your organisation's expenditure? How do you ensure you keep to your budget? Is there anything you can do to improve your financial forecasting?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	Explain how you have introduced changes to product/processes/services in your team/ department.
	Tell me about a time when you had to consider existing/ conflicting workloads, when planning a task/event/project.
	Tell me of a time when you have had to re-prioritise in response to changing requirements/strategic needs.
	In your current job, how do you manage your time and workload to achieve your objectives?
5.5 Effective decision making Makes timely, informed decisions that take into account the facts, goals, constraints and risks.	What big decision did you make recently. How did you go about it?
	What is the decision that you have put off the longest? Why?
	When is the last time that you have refused to make a decision? Tell me about it.
	Tell us about a situation where you made a decision too quickly and got it wrong. What made you take that decision?
	Which constraints are imposed on you in your current job and how do you deal with these?
	Tell me about a time when you took responsibility for making a key decision • What was the decision? How did you defend your decision?
	Tell me of a time when you have had to manage a risk.
	Tell me of a time when you have felt it appropriate to call on others before making a decision.
	Tell me of a time when you have had to justify a decision you have made.
5.6 Analytical thinking Applies analytical thinking by breaking a situation into smaller pieces, tracing the implications of a situation in a step-by-step way. Organises the parts of a problem in a systematic way, making comparisons of different aspects and causal relationships.	Give me an example when you have collected and analysed complex data to inform your decision-making? What approach did you take to analysing the data? What were the key issues you identified? How confident were you with the decisions made?
	What management data or information do you collect and monitor to inform your future plans and/or policies. How do you use the data?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	Describe an occasion when you have had to deliver a complex project on time and to budget. What were the objectives? What key stages did you work through? How did you get people on board? What were the difficulties you had to overcome?
	Tell me how you have handled a large task.
	Give an example of a time when you had to gather and interpret information for a particular purpose.
	Tell me about a time when you had to analyse some information and how you came to your conclusions.
5.7 Ability to work under pressure Keeps composure in stressful or adverse situations	Describe a situation where you had to deal with an angry client
	Describe a situation where you had a disagreement or an argument with a superior. How did you handle it?
	Describe a time when pressures threatened your ability to work effectively.
	Tell me about an occasion when you felt under pressure.
	Tell me of a time when interruptions from others have affected your work.
	Describe when a colleague let you down. How did you respond?

5.2.2 Additional Competencies for Managers

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
6.0 LEADERSHIP *Motivating people to high performance in achieving the team's and organisation's goals.*	Tell me how you manage your top team.
	Tell us about a situation where you had to get a team to improve its performance. What were the problems and how did you address them?
	Tell me about a time when you were less successful as a leader than you would have wanted to be.
	Give an example of when you have led a team on a major project. How did you gain support for this activity beyond your immediate team? How did you ensure your people were engaged and motivated to perform? How did you measure success?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
6.1 Translating strategic goals to everyday work Links vision, values, goals and strategies to everyday work	Describe how you have communicated the vision/ goals of the organisation to your team. Give me an example of how you have managed the concerns of your team during times of uncertainty/change. Tell me how your unit's strategy fits with organisational goals and values.
6.2 Creating positive work environment Creates a positive work environment where staff are motivated to do their best	Give me an example of how you have used your leadership skills to manage and improve team performance. How did you get team buy in? How did you handle any difficult situations that arose amongst the team? Describe a change where you had to drive a team through change. How did you achieve this?
6.3 Goal setting Sets clear, meaningful challenging but attainable group goals and expectations	Tell us about a situation where you faced reluctance from your team to accept the direction that you were setting. Give an example of when you have lead a team on a major project. How did you gain support for this activity beyond your immediate team? How did you ensure your people were engaged and motivated to perform? How did you measure success? Describe how you have established the priorities and activities of a team Describe a time when you set goals for an individual or team. What goals were achieved and how did you go about it? Looking back, what would you have done differently? Tell me how you ensure the quality of your and your unit's work. How do you set objectives for you team?
6.4 Effective delegation Manages staff by delegating and entrusting certain tasks and assisting them to succeed in their performance.	Give me an example of how you have used your delegation skills to manage and improve team performance.
6.5 Staff motivation Regularly provides both positive and critical feedback to team members to improve motivation and performance	Tell us about a situation where you had to get a team to improve its performance. What were the problems and how did you address them?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	Give me an example of when you have had to deal with poor performance. How did you approach the problem? What were the political/personal sensitivities you had to deal with? What were the results? With hindsight, would you have approached this any differently? Have you ever discovered you staff/team were not performing to established standards? What did you do about it? How have you motivated slow or difficult team members? Tell me about a time when you have had to deliver feedback to a colleague / subordinate.
6.6 Leading by example Is an excellent role model – leads by example	Describe a situation where you needed to inspire a team. What challenges did you meet and how did you achieve your objectives? Describe a situation when you motivated those around you with your own example, to achieve team goals.

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
7.0 PLANNING AND ORGANISING *The ability to plan, organise, coordinate and monitor activities and work tasks for self and team members*	Tell me about a time when you have had to plan a project/task/event that involved other people in the implementation.
7.1 Effective planning Plans the best use of available resources	Tell me about a time in which you were required to produce something to a high standard, within a fixed period of time. Tell me about a time when you have had to plan a project/task/ event.
7.2 Team planning Agrees objectives with individuals that support team plans and service goals	How do you set objectives for your team members? Give me an example where this did not work well. What was the cause? What did you do about it.
7.3 Holding members to account for their work results Holds team members to account for achieving the results that have been agreed	Give me an example of when you have had to deal with poor performance. How did you approach the problem? What were the political/personal sensitivities you had to deal with? What were the results?

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
	With hindsight, would you have approached this any differently?
	Please give me an example of how you monitor and manage employees' performance.
	What have you done when performance efficiency has not been satisfactory?
7.4 Risk management Evaluates risk and puts realistic plans in place to manage it	Tell me about a time when you have had to plan a project/task/ event and how did you estimate risk? Tell me about a time when you've had to manage a risk. What' is the biggest risk you have taken at work in the last 2 years? How did it go? How did you manage the risk?
7.5 Ensuring meeting of deadlines Takes early action to deal with issues that affect deadlines to ensure delivery on time	Tell me about a time in which you were required to produce something to a high standard, within a fixed period of time. Tell me about a time when you have had to plan a project/task/ event in a given timeframe. Tell me about a time when you had to consider existing/ conflicting workloads, when planning a task/event/project. Tell me about a time when you didn't meet an objective/deadline.

Competency	Example competency-based interview questions
8.0 DEVELOPING PEOPLE *Developing people to improve their performance and fulfill their potential*	What strategies to you operate to identify and nurture talent in your organisation? How do you ensure staff with potential are identified and developed? How has this benefited your organisation? Tell me how you manage the development of others.
8.1 Identification of team members' training needs Identifies training needs in team members and takes action to meet them by formal or informal learning and development methods	Tell me how you manage the development of others. Have you ever discovered your staff/team were not performing to your standards? What did you do about it? When?

	Please give us an example about how you identified employees' training needs. What measures did you take to educate and develop your people?
8.2 Talent management Identifies talent and potential in staff members and creates development plans to realise it	What strategies to you operate to identify and nurture talent in your organisation? How do you ensure staff with potential are identified and developed? How has this benefited your organisation? Tell me how you manage the development of others.
8.3 Coaching Personally coaches team members to improve their performance	Have you ever experienced a situation when your staff did not perform to your expectations? What did you do about it? Tell me of a time when you have had to work with someone less experienced than yourself. Give me an example of how you coached someone to improve their performance.

5.2.3 Additional Competency for Top Managers

Competency	**Example competency-based interview questions**
9.0 STRATEGIC DIRECTION *Setting the strategic direction of the organisation in response to the needs of Ministers and citizens, and ensuring its delivery.*	Give me an example of when you have had to gain support from stakeholders to implement a strategic decision that had potential to be controversial. How did you handle any objections? How did you get others on board? What were the political/personal sensitivities you had to deal with? What were the results?
9.1 Strategic planning Develops strategic plans to ensure the organisation's future success	What ideas have you developed and implemented that have impacted on the long term strategic development of your organisation? What were the challenges? What was the impact on your organisational strategies? How did you evaluate the effectiveness of these strategies in the long term? Describe an occasion when you have had to develop strategies to implement major organisational change. What were you aiming to achieve? What was your approach to planning? How did you consult and involve relevant people?

	What were the results? If you were doing it again, what would you do differently? Tell me how you have gone about planning for the future direction of your organisation.
9.2 Monitoring of strategic plans Monitors plans to achieve strategic objectives	Tell me how you have gone about planning for the future direction of your organisation/function. How did you monitor its implementation? Describe a strategic change you have recently implemented. How did you monitor its implementation and keep it on track?
9.3 Strategic resource management Secures the resources needed to deliver strategic objectives	How do you currently ensure that you manage your resources effectively? How do you consider costs to the organisation? What environmental factors do you take into account? Describe a strategic change you have recently implemented.
9.4 Taking responsibility for meeting strategic objectives Takes responsibility for ensuring the strategic objectives are met	Describe a strategic change you have recently implemented. Did it achieve its objectives? How did you ensure this?
9.5 Building an effective senior management team Builds an effective senior management team that pulls the organisation together.	Tell us about a situation where you faced reluctance from your senior team to accept the direction that you were setting. Give me an example of how you improve the effectiveness of your senior team in leading the organisation.

6. TRAINING EXERCISES

6.1. TRAINING EXERCISE FOR JOB ANALYSIS – PREPARATION OF JOB DESCRIPTION

Divide the participants of the training into groups of 5–6 people each. Give each group one flip chart paper. You can prepare the flip chart paper earlier by drafting the names of the main elements of job description (purpose, description of jobs, contacts etc). Each group should analyse the job of one of the group members. The other group member should conduct an interview with the participant whose job is analysed while another group member will

draft the job description on the flip chart paper. The other participants in the group will give their comments and actively participate in drafting the job description. At the end of the exercise each group will present their prepared job description to other training participants.

6.2. TRAINING EXERCISE FOR IDENTIFICATION OF COMPETENCES ON THE BASIS OF A JOB DESCRIPTION

If you haven't done this already in the previous exercise, divide the participants into groups of around 5–6 persons. Each group is to sit around a table to role-play the work of a selection panel. The group should choose one goup members to be an interviewee – a candidate to interview.

Provide each group with a job description for either a managerial or non-managerial position (preferably a job description prepared by the group in the previous exercise). Provide each group with the following instructions:

> *Your role is to serve as an interview panel and you are meeting to prepare for a competency– based interview for the job you have just analysed.*
>
> *Elect a panel chairperson to coordinate your discussions and make preparations according to the list we have just discussed. The chairperson will also chair the actual interview at a later stage.*
>
> *As a group, you should:*
>
> - *Select 3–4 priority competences for the provided job description*
> - *Decide on the questions that will be asked*
> - *Decide who will ask each question and in what order.*
> - *Decide how notes will be taken.*

Additional information to be given to trainees before the exercise:

Take some time to familiarise yourself with the priority competencies to be assessed during the interview. The definitions and positive behavioural indicators are available in the Competency Framework. *ALL competency-based questions should be determined before you start interviewing and every candidate should be asked the same questions.*

6.3. TRAINING EXERCISE FOR CONDUCTING COMPETENCY-BASED INTERVIEWS

6.3.1 Conducting the interview (role play)

Each group has already chosen one of its members to be a candidate to interview. The panel, under the coordination of its Chairperson should present their pre-determined competency-based questions to the candidate.

*The candidate should answer from **his/her own real experiences.***

The panel should take the opportunity to probe the candidate until they are satisfied they have sufficient information on each question.

6.3.2 Additional information to be given to trainees before the exercise:

Typically, competency-based questions will frequently ask candidates for examples of how they have dealt with a particular situation in the past. The rationale behind asking for such examples is that past behaviour is a strong predictor of future behaviour in similar situations. Hypothetical questions (such as "What would you do if ...") should be avoided as they gather information that is a less valid predictor of future behaviour.

Very often a candidate's answer to a question will give you some information but not enough to make an assessment of the competency you are assessing. What is needed then are probing questions to follow up the initial question.

Interviews should follow a clear structure; however, the questions should not be followed slavishly as this will interrupt the flow of the interview. It is good practice to explain to the candidate how the interview will be structured, and that you will be asking for specific examples of when they have demonstrated the competencies required for the role. Ask them to bear in mind that you'll be interested in:

- Examples from their work life
- Recent examples preferably – the last 2–3 years
- What they individually did or said, not the team as a whole (it is fine if they need time to think of an example)

The questions and probes should be structured as follows:

- Situation – What is the example?
- Task – Ask them to describe their detailed task

- Action – What did they do?
- Result – What was the outcome? How did it go/what would they do differently?

As the panel asks their questions you should make notes, using an interview assessment form. You are looking for evidence that the criteria have been met in the responses to the questions and in the examples that candidates give. Be aware that in many instances, applicants answering a question on one competency will provide insight into their proficiency in others as well.

Asking each candidate the same competency-based behavioral questions will ensure a fair evaluation of the applicants on the same set of competencies. Panel members should have the definitions of the competencies in front of them during the interview.

6.3.3 Additional guidelines for members of selection committees (including the Chairperson)

All panel members should make notes on candidates' answers during interviews to aid the subsequent collective evaluation. Notes should be based on what the interviewee actually interview questions will be framed around. Notes should be an accurate record of what the said or did in the interview, not on the interviewer's personal inferences. It is important to separate observation from evaluation. Ask questions clearly and clarifyissues that need clarification. Follow up with probing questions where necessary. Probing should be tailored to the responses received from the candidate, it cannot be scripted in advance.

Allow for silence on tough questions that seek specific detail to allow candidates to consider the question and think through it before answering. Put the candidates at ease, let them know they have time before you expect an answer.

Seek contrary evidence in your interviews. If the interview is painting a picture of negative past behavior on the job, seek to find evidence of good behavior or performance to get a balanced view of the candidate. The same is true when a candidate seems perfect, perhaps too perfect.

Assess each candidate against the criteria in the job specification and competency descriptions, rather than against each other. If there is a difference in opinion within the panel, reassess the candidates by going back through the job specification and how a candidate scored on each one of the criteria again, if needed. The final decision should be agreed by all members of the panel.

The Chair of the panel is expected to fully participate in the asking og questions. In addition, s/he will control the proceedings, including time-keeping of the interviews, as required.

Actions during the interview:

- Welcome the candidate and introduce panel members.

- Explain the overall process to the candidate and that they can expect panel members to take notes.

- Ask an opening question designed to relax the candidate and help them to overcome nervousness, if required.

- Monitor the process and intervene if any panel member asks inappropriate question.

- Ensure that all questions are competency-based, avoiding hypothetical questions.

- Ensure that the candidates have an accurate picture of both the job itself and of the terms and conditions relating to it, and provide an opportunity at the end of the interview for candidates to ask any questions and offer any additional information.

- Bring the interview to a close by thanking the candidate for their time. Explain the decision-making process and how and when the candidate will be informed of the outcome.

6.4 TRAINING EXERCISE FOR ASSESSING THE CANDIDATE AFTER THE INTERVIEW

This session should be coordinated by the panel Chairperson

Step 1

Each panel member should use the scoring form to assess the candidate, based on their own interview notes. This should be done in silence and with no consultation with others.

Step 2

Each panel member in turn shares their scores and assessments. The panel Chairperson should record these on a matrix on the flipchart. An example matrix is attached.

Step 3

The panel will collectively discuss the scoring results and decide by consensus whether to consider the candidate qualified for the position or not. Panel members are allowed to question and challenge each other and

to seek justification for particular scores. Judgments should be based on facts and evidence that came from the interview.

6.4.1 Additional information to be given to trainees before the exercise:

Actions during the decision-making process:

- Keep accurate notes of the decision-making process, including clear reasons for deeming someone unsuitable.

- Ensure that the assessment is carried out in a fair and transparent manner and that recruitment and selection procedures and policy have been followed correctly to avoid any claims of unfair treatment.

- The Chairperson should invite all panel members to give feedback and share their scores on the candidates, finishing with the chair's own feedback.

- Provide the results obtained from any other tests, or invite the HR representative to do so.

- Lead the panel in reaching a consensus on whether each candidate meets the basic requirements of a given position, for example, through an overall score.

Assessing candidates and deciding a rank order

As discussed above, immediately after each interview the panel members should discuss and compare their notes made during the interview and decide whether the basic requirements for a position have been met by that particular candidate. Based on this they should complete the interview score sheet. Each candidate deserves to be scored carefully, using the same criteria for each applicant. In assessing the overall qualifications level of each candidate, the panel members should ask themselves questions such as:

- How relevant were the personal examples sescribed by the candidate?

- Did the examples demonstrate that the candidate possessed personal qualities and qualifications for the kind of job s/he had applied for?

- Did the applicant's personal qualities and qualifications meet the expectations of the institution concerned?

- For middle and top-management level positions: did the candidate through the examples given demonstrate good leadership abilities, as well as personal characteristics that that are required of a good leader?

An example of a final assessment form is found below. Once the final assessment form for each candidate has been completed, time has come to decide how the candidates should be ranked. Such a rank order should clearly distinguish between candidates who are considered qualified for the position, and those who are not. The internal ranking of qualified candidates should be based on a careful evaluation of the experience, skills and competencies of each candidate and how they compare to one another. Each member of the panel will have his/her evidence to bring to the discussion and it is to be expected that panel members may have different views on how the candidates should be ranked. Discussions and judgments should be based on the final assessment form for each candidate, supplemented by the evidence of facts gathered during the selection process.

In many cases, the individual ranking between qualified candidates turns out to be rather straight forward, in other cases it may be difficult to distinguish between two or several candidates. In that case, each of the candidates' strong and, if applicable, weak points should be contrasted with what is most important for doing a good job in the position concerned.

A scoring matrix may be used to aggregate all the scores agreed by the panel for all candidates to assist in the decision-making process on who should be ranked as number one, number two, etc. The purpose of this evaluation process is to appoint the best candidate for the job, i.e. the one who most closely matches the specifications and requirements derived from the job description. If none of the candidates meet the requirements in an acceptable way, it would be normal to announce the vacent position once more, in order to attract new candidates.

Assessment form for the interview of a candidate

The assessment form for each candidate should initially be filled in by each member for the panel individually. The **FINAL** assessment form for a candidate is agreed by all members of the panel, through a focussed discussion of each competence/qualification that the position requires. The rank order of the candidates is based on the final assessment forms, supplemented by additional evidence if required.

Name and surname of the candidate:	Work post:
Institution:	Date:

I   Assessment of competencies:

Competencies/qualifications	Grades (1 – 5)
1.	
2.	
3.	
4.	
5.	
...	
Total number of points (1+2+3+4 + 5 +...)	

Comments (optional):

Key candidate's strenghts:	Noticed weaknesses:

Signature of the competition commission member:

_____